CHAPTER IV RESEARCH FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

A. Research Result

There were several data collected from the research field. The researcher used three data collection methods: observation, interview, and documentation. The observation was conducted in the X MIPA 2 classroom of MA Ma'ahid Kudus on August 3rd 2022, August 7th 2022, and August 10th 2022. During the first meeting, the researcher introduced herself to the students and explained her intention to conduct a research by observing the English teaching and learning in the classroom. Throughout the observation process, the researcher took a position as a non-participant observer, who visits, records, and notes the participants' activities in the classroom. The interview was a semi-structured interview that was conducted on Wednesday August 10th 2022 from 13.10 until 13.50 WIB. The participants are five students and an English teacher of X MIPA 2. Throughout the research process, the researcher took some documentation including written documents, recorded voices, and taken pictures as the research documentation. The results data sorted based on the relation with the research questions; (1) How is the implementation of code switching by the English teacher in the ELT process? (2) What types of code switching are used by the English teacher in the ELT process? (3) How are the students' perceptions toward the use of code switching used by the English teacher in the ELT process?

1. The Implementation of Code Switching by the English Teacher in X MIPA 2

The researcher used the observation results supported by the documentation to find out how is the implementation of code switching by the English teacher in X MIPA 2. The observation results show that the English teacher implemented all three code switching functions¹ in the language learning classroom:

a) Topic Switch

The English teacher used code switching for switching or adjusting the topic discussed. For example: "After all of you finished, please clean the whiteboard. *Habis ini pelajarannya siapa*?".

¹ Thomas Wahyu Prabowo Mukti, "Code Switching in the Instructions of English Language Education Study Program Lecturers" *Journal on Language and Language Teaching* 19, no.1, (2016): 46, Accessed on 12 January 2022. https://doi.org/10.24071/llt.v19i1.311.g266.

b) Affective Function

The English teacher used code switching it to create solidarity relationships with his students. For example: *"Yang belum paham silakan*, raise your hand!"

c) Repetitive Function

The English teacher used code switching it to explain the meaning of something. For example: "*Yang berani jawab*, come forward, *maju ke depan*"²

In order to find more related data, the researcher interviewed Mr. Atok Waspodo, S.Pd as the English teacher of MIPA 2. The interview was semi-structured. The researcher drew some points from the interview results, they are:

- a) The English teacher understood code switching strategy and he applied that strategy in the ELT process in order to make the teaching and learning process become more effective.
- b) The reason for applying code switching is because the English teacher understands the students' vocabulary ability level, he intends to make the students understand his explanation easier.
- c) Code switching does facilitate the students to understand English better
- d) Code switching does increase students' motivation in learning English
- e) There are improvements in students' understanding of the English material because the teacher used code switching while teaching.³

The English teacher also tell the researcher that the average students' daily test score is exceed the minimum mastery standard, proving that the students can understand the English teacher's explanation on the teaching and learning activity.

2. Types of Code Switching Used by the English Teacher in the ELT Process

The researcher used the observation results supported by the documentation to find out the types of code switching used by the English teacher in X MIPA 2. The researcher used observation sheets to collect the data as shown below:

² Classroom Observation at MA Ma'ahid Kudus, August 3rd, 2022.

³ Atok Waspodo. Interview by Researcher. Kudus, August 10th 2022.

Statement of Observation	Yes	No	Examples
The teacher uses Inter Sentential Code Switching	V		"ring the <i>absen</i> here"
The teacher uses Intra Sentential Code Switching	V		<i>"Yang berani jawab</i> , come forward"
The teacher uses Establishing Continuity Switches	P	V	7
The teacher uses Emblematic Code Switching	v	Ţ	"Understand kan?" ⁴

Table 4.1Observation Result

The researcher found that the English teacher used three out of four types of code switching during the ELT process. The researcher also took some notes about the spoken sentences by the English teacher that contains the code switching elements as listed below:

a) Intra-Sentential Switches

The English teacher switched his language from English to Indonesian or vice versa in the middle of the same clause or sentence, such as when he said "Bring the *absen* here", "Subject *ini* best friendnya to be", "*Sampai sini* understand?"

b) Inter-Sentential Switches

The English teacher used both English and Indonesian in different clauses within a sentence limit, such as when he said "Please clean the whiteboard *yang piket ya* ", "*Yang belum paham silakan*, raise your hand!", "*Yang berani jawab*, come forward! *Maju ke depan!*"

⁴ Classroom Observation at MA Ma'ahid Kudus, August 3rd, 2022.

c) Establishing Continuity Switches

The teacher had not used this type of code switching. He asked his students to speak using English, then he also used English when replied to them

d) Emblematic Switching

The English teacher inserted Indonesian tags, exclamations, and typical expressions, such as when he said "Understand *kan?*", "*Nah*, the subject is Anna".⁵

3. Students' Perceptions toward the Use of Code Switching Used by the English Teacher in the ELT Process

The researcher used the interview results with 5 students of MIPA 2 to know about the MIPA 2 students' perception of the use of code switching by the English teacher in ELT. The interview was a semi-structured interview that used structural verification questions. Structural verification questions lead the students to answer the question using verification terms that are displayed as two types of verification; Agree and Disagree. The interview topics are related to the code switching implementation in the classroom.

As the English teacher used code switching in order to make the teaching and learning process become more effective, the researcher formed the interview questions based on some indicators of effective teaching and learning; good learning process, good quality of students' responses, and good communicative process.⁶ The questions and the results of the students' interviews are shown below:

a) Effective teaching indicators: Good learning process

Interview Result I			
	Students	Answers	
Interview Questions		Agree	Disagree
Jika guru Bahasa Inggris hanya menggunakan	HA		V
Bahasa Inggris ketika	AJ		V
menjelaskan materi, dapatkah anda memahami	FI		V
auparkan anda memanami	NO		V

Table 4.2Interview Result I

⁵ Classroom Observation at MA Ma'ahid Kudus, August 3rd, 2022.

⁶ Eko Purwanti, "Classroom Management: Applying Appropriate Strategies to Enhance Effective Teaching, "Journal *of Foreign Language Teaching and Learning* 6, no. 1 (2021): 79, Accessed on 12 February, 2022. https://doi.org/10.18196/ftl.v6i1.10638.

materi tersebut?	IN		V
Apakah anda merasa	HA	V	
terbantu dalam memahami	AJ	V	
pelajaran dengan code	FI	V	
switching yang diterapkan	NO	V	
oleh guru Bahasa Inggris saat mengajar?	IN	V	
Apakah terdapat	HA	V	
peningkatan pemahaman	AJ	V	
anda terhadap mater <mark>i</mark>	FI	V	
ketika guru B <mark>ahasa Inggris</mark>	NO	V	
anda mengg <mark>unakan</mark> code switching di k <mark>el</mark> as?	IN	v	

The students found it difficult to understand what the English teacher is saying when he speaks English. HA said "Oh nggak bisa mbak, apalagi kalau kata-katanya susah"⁷, AJ said "Bisa sedikit, tapi kesulitan mbak, jadi pahamnya enggak... enggak mendalam"⁸, FI said "Paling paham tapi cuma dikit, yang bahasa inggris gampanggampang"⁹, NO said "Bisa sedikit, tapi harus ekstra konsentrasi, tapi kalau ada kosa kata asing, engga bisa"¹⁰, IN said "Tidak paham, paling pahamnya yes no hehehe"¹¹.

When the teacher explains the lesson material using English, the students often don't understand it. The way the English teacher switches from English to Indonesian helps the students to understand the material better. All of the students answers showed agreement that code switching strategy applied by the English teacher is able to help them understand the lesson better. HA said "*Terbantu, misalnya Mr.Atok nyebut kata pakai Inggris terus diulangi tapi pake Indo, itu membantu banget*"¹², AJ said ""Jadi lebih mudah paham"¹³, FI also agreed "Ya, jelas terbantu"¹⁴, NO said

⁷ HA. Interview by Researcher. Kudus, August 10th 2022.

⁸ AJ. Interview by Researcher. Kudus, August 10th 2022.

⁹ FI. Interview by Researcher. Kudus, August 10th 2022.

¹⁰ NO. Interview by Researcher. Kudus, August 10th 2022.

¹¹ IN. Interview by Researcher. Kudus, August 10th 2022.

¹² HA. Interview by Researcher. Kudus, August 10th 2022.

¹³ FI. Interview by Researcher. Kudus, August 10th 2022.

¹⁴ NO. Interview by Researcher. Kudus, August 10th 2022.

"Terbantu sekali, jadi lebih mudah memahami materi" and IN said *"Sangat terbantu sekali terus lebih nyaman gitu"*¹⁵.

b) Effective teaching indicators: Good quality of students' response and good communicative process

	Students	Answers	
Interview Questions		Agree	Disagree
Apakah kamu dapat	HA	V	
berkomunikasi dengan	AJ	V	
lebih baik ketika gu <mark>ru</mark>	FI	V	
Bahasa Inggris	NO	V	
menggunakan code switching?	IN	v	
Apakah kamu dapat	HA	V	
berkom <mark>un</mark> ikasi dengan lebih baik ketika guru	AJ	V	
	FI	V	
Bahasa Inggris	NO	V	
menggunakan code switching?	IN	1	V

Table 4.3Interview Result II

All of the students agreed that it is easier to communicate with the English teacher when he used code switching. HA said "Jadi bisa kayak tau intinya beliau ngomong apa"¹⁶, AJ said "Iya, lebih paham"¹⁷, FI also agreed "Jadi bisa menangkap yang Mr.Atok ucapkan"¹⁸, NO said "Iya, lebih mudah berkomunikasi"¹⁹ and IN said "jadi tahu beliau bicarain apa".²⁰

Four out of five students increased their urge to respond to the teacher when he speaks using code

¹⁵ IN. Interview by Researcher. Kudus, August 10th 2022.

¹⁶ HA. Interview by Researcher. Kudus, August 10th 2022.

¹⁷ AJ. Interview by Researcher. Kudus, August 10th 2022.

¹⁸ FI. Interview by Researcher. Kudus, August 10th 2022.

¹⁹ NO. Interview by Researcher. Kudus, August 10th 2022.

²⁰ IN. Interview by Researcher. Kudus, August 10th 2022.

switching strategy. HA said "Lebih berani merespons"²¹, AJ said "Iya, betul"²², FI also explained "Kalau gak tahu Mr.Atok ngomong apa ya takut kalau mau kasih respon"²³, NO said "Jadi berani respons karena tahu Mr. Atok ngomong apa".²⁴

One student that appeared to disagree was IN. She told the researcher that she remains passive in the class because she is not interested in English lesson. She said "*Tergantung pelajarannya sih, kalau suka ya aktif*"²⁵. She revealed that she likes to be active in the math lesson.²⁶

For further understanding, the researcher asked the students more questions as shown below:

	Students	Answers	
Interview Questions		Agree	Disagree
Menurut anda, ap <mark>aka</mark> h	HA	V	
sebaiknya strategi code switching tetap digunakan di dalam kelas?	AJ	V	
	FI	V	
	NO	V	
	IN	V	
Menurut anda, apakah	HA		V
strategi code switching yang	AJ		V
diterapkan oleh guru Bahasa	FI	7	V
Inggris di kelas memiliki	NO		V
kekurangan?	IN		V

Table 4.4 Interview Result III

All of the students agree that the English teacher should keep using code switching strategy in the ELT process. HA said "*Tetap digunakan*"²⁷, AJ said "*Iya, tetap digunakan*"²⁸, FI also agreed "*Tetap digunakan aja*"²⁹, NO

²¹ HA. Interview by Researcher. Kudus, August 10th 2022.

²² AJ. Interview by Researcher. Kudus, August 10th 2022.

²³ FI. Interview by Researcher. Kudus, August 10th 2022.

²⁴ NO. Interview by Researcher. Kudus, August 10th 2022.

²⁵ IN. Interview by Researcher. Kudus, August 10th 2022.

²⁶ IN. Interview by Researcher. Kudus, August 10th 2022.

²⁷ HA. Interview by Researcher. Kudus, August 10th 2022.

²⁸ AJ. Interview by Researcher. Kudus, August 10th 2022.

²⁹ FI. Interview by Researcher. Kudus, August 10th 2022.

said "*Tetap digunakan*"³⁰ and IN said "*Iya… tetap digunakan*".³¹

Furthermore, they don't find any weakness in the code switching strategy applied by the English teacher. HA said "*Kekurangan sih gak ada ya, oke-oke aja*"³², AJ said "*Tidak ada sih…*"³³, FI also agreed "*Gak ada sih kekurangannya*"³⁴, NO said "*Tidak punya kekurangan*"³⁵ and IN said "*Menurut saya sih gak ada*".³⁶

The students' perceptions towards the use of code switching by the English teacher are analyzed from the interview results. The researcher want to know if the students were easier to understand the English material and more comfortable with communicating with the teacher when the teacher used code switching strategy, that means code switching used by the teacher helps to fulfill the effective teaching indicators; good learning process and good students' response³⁷.

B. Discussion

In the discussion section, the researcher interpreted the findings previously presented and explain the results.

1. The Implementation of Code Switching used by the English teacher of X MIPA 2

The research results found out the code switching implementation by the English teacher of X MIPA 2 had three functions; topic switch, affective function, and repetitive function. The teacher's sentences analyzed by the researcher as shown below:

a) Topic Switch

The English teacher said, "After all of you finished, please clean the whiteboard. *Habis ini pelajarannya siapa*?".³⁸ The code switching in this sentence had a topic switch function because the teacher used it to

³⁰ NO. Interview by Researcher. Kudus, August 10th 2022.

³¹ IN. Interview by Researcher. Kudus, August 10th 2022.

³² HA. Interview by Researcher. Kudus, August 10th 2022.

³³ FA. Interview by Researcher. Kudus, August 10th 2022.

³⁴ AJ. Interview by Researcher. Kudus, August 10th 2022.

³⁵ NO. Interview by Researcher. Kudus, August 10th 2022.

³⁶ IN. Interview by Researcher. Kudus, August 10th 2022.

³⁷ Eko Purwanti, "Classroom Management: Applying Appropriate Strategies to Enhance Effective Teaching, "Journal *of Foreign Language Teaching and Learning* 6, no. 1 (2021): 79, Accessed on 12 February, 2022. https://doi.org/10.18196/ftl.v6i1.10638.

³⁸ Classroom Observation at MA Ma'ahid Kudus, August 3rd, 2022.

switch the topic being discussed.³⁹

b) Affective Function

The English teacher said, "*Yang belum paham silakan*, raise your hand!".⁴⁰ The code switching in this sentence creates solidarity between the teacher and the students. It also stimulates the students to recognize typical English sentences that are usually used in the classroom. Therefore, the function of code switching in this sentence is an affective function.⁴¹

c) Repetitive Function

The English teacher said, "Come forward, *maju ke depan*"⁴² The code switching in this sentence happened between two clauses in English and Indonesian language that have the same meaning. The teacher used code switching to explain the meaning of the English clause. It means the code switching function of this sentence is a repetitive function.⁴³

The English teacher considered that code switching does facilitate the students to understand English better and it does increase students' motivation in learning English.⁴⁴ It shows that the code switching applied by the English teacher helps to fulfil the effective teaching indicators; good learning process and success in the lesson's objectives.⁴⁵

³⁹ Thomas Wahyu Prabowo Mukti, "Code Switching in the Instructions of English Language Education Study Program Lecturers" *Journal on Language and Language Teaching* 19, no.1, (2016): 50, Accessed on 12 January, 2022. <u>https://doi.org/10.24071/llt.v19i1.311.g266</u>.

⁴⁰ Classroom Observation at MA Ma'ahid Kudus, August 3rd, 2022.

⁴¹ Thomas Wahyu Prabowo Mukti, "Code Switching in the Instructions of English Language Education Study Program Lecturers" *Journal on Language and Language Teaching* 19, no.1, (2016): 50, Accessed on 12 January, 2022. https://doi.org/10.24071/llt.v19i1.311.g266.

⁴² Classroom Observation at MA Ma'ahid Kudus, August 3rd, 2022.

⁴³ Thomas Wahyu Prabowo Mukti, "Code Switching in the Instructions of English Language Education Study Program Lecturers" *Journal on Language and Language Teaching* 19, no.1, (2016): 50, Accessed on 12 January, 2022. https://doi.org/10.24071/llt.v19i1.311.g266.

⁴⁴ Atok Waspodo. Interview by Researcher. Kudus, August 10th 2022.

⁴⁵ Eko Purwanti, "Classroom Management: Applying Appropriate Strategies to Enhance Effective Teaching, "Journal *of Foreign Language Teaching and Learning* 6, no. 1 (2021): 79, Accessed on 12 February, 2022. https://doi.org/10.18196/ftl.v6i1.10638.

2. Types of Code Switching used by the English teacher of X MIPA 2

The research results found out the English teacher of X MIPA 2 used four types of code switching; intra-sentential switches, inter-sentential switches, and emblematic switching.⁴⁶ From the taken notes, the researcher analyzed the English teacher's sentences based on the code switching types:

Types				
English Tagahar'a	Types of	Anglemation		
Teacher's	Code	Analyzation		
Sentences	Switching			
"Bring the <i>absen</i> here"	Intra- sentential Switches	"Bring" and "the" and "Here" are English terms, " <i>Absen</i> " is an Indonesian term that is spoken after them. The language switching happened in the middle of a sentence boundary, so the code switching type is intra-sentential switches. ⁴⁷		
"Subject ini best	Intra-	"Subject", "Best", "Friend" and		
friendnya to be"	sentential Switches	"To Be" are English terms, " <i>Ini</i> " is an Indonesian term that is spoken after them. The language switching happened in the middle of a sentence boundary, so the code switching type is intra-sentential switches. ⁴⁸		
"Sampai sini	Intra-	"Sampai" and "Sini" are		

 Table 4.5

 Analyzation of Code Switching

 Types

⁴⁶ Lusiana Kartika Candra, Laila Ulsi Qodriani, "An Analysis of Code Switching in Leila S. Chudori's *for Nadira*" *Teknosastik* 16, no. 1 (2018): 10, Accessed on 12 February, 2022. <u>https://doi.org/10.33365/ts.v16i1.128</u>.

⁴⁷ Lusiana Kartika Candra, Laila Ulsi Qodriani, "An Analysis of Code Switching in Leila S. Chudori's *for Nadira*" *Teknosastik* 16, no. 1 (2018): 10, Accessed on 12 February, 2022. <u>https://doi.org/10.33365/ts.v16i1.128</u>.

 ⁴⁸ Lusiana Kartika Candra, Laila Ulsi Qodriani, "An Analysis of Code Switching in Leila S. Chudori's *for Nadira*" *Teknosastik* 16, no. 1 (2018): 10, Accessed on 12 February, 2022. <u>https://doi.org/10.33365/ts.v16i1.128</u>.

REPOSITORI IAIN KUDUS

understand?"	sentential	Indonesian terms, "Understand" is
understand.	Switches	and English term that is spoken
	5 Witches	after them. The language switching
		happened in the middle of a
		sentence boundary, so the code
		switching type is intra-sentential
		switches. ⁴⁹
Yang belum	Inter-	"Yang belum paham silakan" is an
paham silakan,	sentential	Indonesian clause, "raise your
raise your hand!"	Switches	hand!" is an English clause. The
		language switching happened
		between different clauses within a
		sentence limit, so the code
		switching type is inter-sentential
	VIT	switches. ⁵⁰
"Please clean the	Inter-	"Please clean the whiteboard is an
whiteboard, bagi	sentential	English clause, "bagi yang piket
yang piket ya"	Switches	<i>ya</i> " is an Indonesian clause. The
		language switching happened
	H	between different clauses within a
		sentence limit, so the code
		switching type is inter-sentential
		switches. ⁵¹
Yang berani	Inter-	"Yang berani jawab" and "Maju ke
<i>jawab</i> , come	sentential	depan!" are Indonesian clauses,
forward! Maju ke	Switches	"come forward!" is an English
depan!"		clause. The language switching
		happened between different clauses
		within a sentence limit, so the code
		switching type is inter-sentential $\frac{52}{52}$
		switches. ⁵²

⁴⁹ Lusiana Kartika Candra, Laila Ulsi Qodriani, "An Analysis of Code Switching in Leila S. Chudori's *for Nadira*" *Teknosastik* 16, no. 1 (2018): 10, Accessed on 12 February, 2022. <u>https://doi.org/10.33365/ts.v16i1.128</u>.

 ⁵⁰ Lusiana Kartika Candra, Laila Ulsi Qodriani, "An Analysis of Code Switching in Leila S. Chudori's *for Nadira*" *Teknosastik* 16, no. 1 (2018): 10, Accessed on 12 February, 2022. <u>https://doi.org/10.33365/ts.v16i1.128</u>.
 ⁵¹ Lusiana Kartika Candra, Laila Ulsi Qodriani, "An Analysis of Code Switching

 ⁵¹ Lusiana Kartika Candra, Laila Ulsi Qodriani, "An Analysis of Code Switching in Leila S. Chudori's *for Nadira*" *Teknosastik* 16, no. 1 (2018): 10, Accessed on 12 February, 2022. <u>https://doi.org/10.33365/ts.v16i1.128</u>.
 ⁵² Lusiana Kartika Candra, Laila Ulsi Qodriani, "An Analysis of Code Switching

⁵² Lusiana Kartika Candra, Laila Ulsi Qodriani, "An Analysis of Code Switching in Leila S. Chudori's *for Nadira*" *Teknosastik* 16, no. 1 (2018): 10, Accessed on 12 February, 2022. <u>https://doi.org/10.33365/ts.v16i1.128</u>.

REPOSITORI IAIN KUDUS

"Understand	Emblematic	"Understand" is an English term,
kan?"	Switching	while "kan" is an Indonesian
		sentence tag. The language
		switching happened on a sentence
		tag, it means the code switching
		type is emblematic switching. ⁵³
"Nah, the subject	Emblematic	"Nah" is an Indonesian
is Anna"	Switching	exclamation, while "the subject is
		Anna" is an English sentence. The
		language switching happened on a
		sentence exclamation, it means the
		code switching type is emblematic
		switching. ⁵⁴

3. Students' Perception towards the Use of Code Switching used by the English teacher

The students' perceptions towards the use of code switching by the English teacher are analyzed from the interview results. The researcher found out that the students were easier to understand the English material when the teacher used code switching strategy. It shows that code switching used by the teacher helps to fulfill the effective teaching indicators; good learning process⁵⁵. The students are also more comfortable communicating with the English teacher or responding the English teacher's question when the English teacher uses code switching. It shows that code switching used by the teacher helps to fulfil the effective teaching indicators; success in the communicative process and good quality of students' response.⁵⁶

The students expect the English teacher to keep using code switching strategy during the teaching and learning

⁵³ Lusiana Kartika Candra, Laila Ulsi Qodriani, "An Analysis of Code Switching in Leila S. Chudori's *for Nadira*" *Teknosastik* 16, no. 1 (2018): 10, Accessed on 12 February, 2022. <u>https://doi.org/10.33365/ts.v16i1.128</u>.

⁵⁴ Lusiana Kartika Candra, Laila Ulsi Qodriani, "An Analysis of Code Switching in Leila S. Chudori's *for Nadira*" *Teknosastik* 16, no. 1 (2018): 10, Accessed on 12 February, 2022. <u>https://doi.org/10.33365/ts.v16i1.128</u>.

³⁵ Eko Purwanti, "Classroom Management: Applying Appropriate Strategies to Enhance Effective Teaching, "Journal *of Foreign Language Teaching and Learning* 6, no. 1 (2021): 79, Accessed on 12 February, 2022. https://doi.org/10.18196/ftl.v6i1.10638.

⁵⁶ Eko Purwanti, "Classroom Management: Applying Appropriate Strategies to Enhance Effective Teaching, "Journal *of Foreign Language Teaching and Learning* 6, no. 1 (2021): 79, Accessed on 12 February, 2022. https://doi.org/10.18196/ftl.v6i1.10638.

process, which means they are happy with it. The students' happiness caused by their good perception when they study.⁵⁷ The overall data findings showed that the students gave positive perceptions towards the use of code switching used by the English teacher in the ELT process.

Students' positive perception leads to happiness, and will affect their desire and action in the learning process. When students have a good perception, they will understand the lesson easily because their mind is happy while studying the lesson. Teacher have to accommodate the positive perception of the learners by examining the teaching strategy that brings a positive perception from the students. In this case, the teaching strategy is code switching. Code switching can improve the students' happiness while learning English, leading to the desire and action in learning and good learning outcomes.⁵⁸



⁵⁷ Lufna Lathifa, "Students' Perception of Teacher's Method in Learning English at The Second Grade of SMP Laniang Makassar" (Thesis of State Islamic Institute Parepare, 2021), 14-17.

⁵⁸ Lufna Lathifa, "Students' Perception of Teacher's Method in Learning English at The Second Grade of SMP Laniang Makassar" (Thesis of State Islamic Institute Parepare, 2021), 14-17.