CHAPTER IV RESULT AND DISCUSSION

A. Research Result

In this chapter, the researcher would like to narrate the participant's experience based on their statement while interviewing about their listening English experiences. Their special condition shows that they had hearing impairment, which can be challenging in the listening classroom. Then, the result of the research would be interpreted by each participant's statement based on research questions. This is the result of the data then discussing their experiences in the listening classroom and their future recommendation for students with special requirements and lecturers. Then, the researcher will make some summaries to present the findings of this research.

1. FN Experiences in Listening Classroom

FN is a graduate student of the English education faculty from a private Islamic university in Jepara. FN's condition as a deaf person did not make her feel inferior even though she had to study at a regular campus. On the other hand, FN felt very happy to be able to study at an ordinary campus even though she had to fight harder than other students did.

"I feel very happy to be able to study at the regular campus. Although I have to struggle, more than other does students do. I am aware of my limitations as a deaf person." (FN, Interview, 17th March 2023)

The courage that emerged from FN was not able without reason. FN has started school education at a special school for persons with disabilities, namely a special needs school located in Jepara. FN's mother took this step while observing FN's condition that had experienced speech delay since childhood due to deafness.

"I've been deaf since birth, Mom said. At first, my mother didn't really notice that I got this condition. It's just a bit of a time of growth in toddlerhood. Many of my friends my age can talk, and babble, but I can't. She said I was a bit difficult to communicate with. What's the term? You know speech delay. Even though I can still be talked to when I look directly, it was still difficult for me to develop my language skill when I was child. That's why my mom is afraid of me. She is even afraid that I have an intellectual deficiency to the point that I

26

¹ FN, Interview by Researcher, on March 17, 2023, interview 1, FN-4 Transcript

can't study at school, right? That's why she is checking me into the doctor. Thankfully, there was nothing wrong with my IQ. It's just a lack of hearing. And it turned out that only one ear was disturbed. So from there, because my house and SLB (Special school) were not too far away, and my mom had enough time to pick me up, <u>I was transmitted to SDLB (elementary for special needs school) near my house here.</u> You know, right?" (FN, Interview, 17th March 2023)

It is just that the problem that arises in the future is the disruption of verbal communication while undergoing education at the special needs school. FN's mother found it more difficult to communicate verbally with FN because she was used to speaking sign language at school. Even though FN had been train by her parents to communicate like a normal people since childhood. Moreover, FN's mother also had difficulty memorizing sign language. So, she started to think about the long-term consequences; how will FN communicate with normal people who cannot talk in sign language? Finally, FN was transferred to a regular school to live a normal life until she entered the campus. It is including getting used to speaking verbally using hearing aids.

"But the problem is, after I came into a special school for disabilities, even in the same class as deaf people, my mother became even more confused about how to communicate with me. In SLB schools, deaf and mute students must be taught sign language. Well, that's what I was taught too. Then, I learned at school and I also practiced at home. That's why my mom is even dizzier. Instead of being trained to hear and speak like normal people, she became confused because we are used to speaking in sign language. Moreover, my mom also has not memorized sign language anyway. Even though before I went to school at SLB, I was still taught by my mother how to communicate and listen like a normal person, right? That's why my mom is even more worried that I can't interact with normal people. From there I was transferred to an ordinary elementary school. Get used to the environment of normal people. Even though I got some missed lessons academically from my friends, my mother was happy because

² FN, Interview by Researcher, on March 17, 2023, interview 1, FN-7 Transcript

<u>I</u> was able to socialize naturally with people. Continue to college."³ (FN, Interview, 17th March 2023)

The success of education at school was also greatly influenced by the support and assistance from the people around FN. Her friends did not discriminate against FN and accepted FN in a social environment. Furthermore, FN's friends were even willing to help FN when she faced learning difficulties and invited FN to develop herself by participating in organizational activities. This organization has really helped FN get to know many people and explore her talents.

"Thankfully, my friends and lecturers are kind. They treated me the same as friends and other students. Their treatment never discriminated against me. Moreover, I'm pretty quick to interact with people. So yeah, I really enjoy hanging out with them. Learn with them too. It's just that in learning activities, I'm a bit of a bother to my other friends because I'm studying at the regular campus; I'm the only different one. So I have to try hard to adjust even though, of course, it won't be the same as other students. But my fellow students and lecturers did not hesitate to help me in my lecture activities. Then again, I'm pretty much involved in student organizations. So I have a lot of friends, relations from various departments, and lecturers who are quite convenient also. Anyway, good people always ask me to develop and explore myself. So they just help me grow in all aspects." (FN, Interview, 17th March 2023)

At first, FN received this assistance from FN's classmate who was also studying at the same campus. FN was able to adapt quickly and found many people who were willing to help or give advice on dealing with lecture problems based on the limitations she had.

"It's just about the earlier, and then there's a bit of worry. Certainly. Even though I'm used to being in a regular school, and having lots of friends, I still can't imagine how scary the campus world would be. Fear of not being able to adjust. Fortunately, my classmates when I was in high school came to the same campus. So I'm not alone there. And from there, my friends also helped me a lot to adapt to the environment. Like how can I get to know my friends more quickly, and then

³ FN, Interview by Researcher, on March 17, 2023, interview 1, FN-8 Transcript

⁴ FN, Interview by Researcher, on March 17, 2023, interview 1, FN-12 Transcript

be invited to join the organization as well."⁵ (FN, WhatsApp Interview, 8th April 2023)

FN is also not given special treatment by her friends or lecturers so that she can go through lectures comfortably. What's more, friends and lecturers concerned are willing to assist with the problems that FN is facing.

"Absolutely not. There is no special treatment from friends and lecturers. But if there are problems and difficulties in lecture activities they are so well-minded." (FN, Interview, 17th March 2023)

The assistance they provided was very diverse. A simple example is that they are willing to understand FN's situation when she was not listening. They were also willing to repeat themselves until FN understands. They were even willing to re-explain material from the lecturer if there are parts that FN does not understand.

"I'm really grateful that even if I'm a little slow and it's a bit difficult to connect when spoken to, they still understand my situation. Don't treat me discriminatively. In fact, with my situation like this, their concern is even greater. Like to help me when it seems difficult to catch the explanation. Or, if they say it once or twice, it seems I don't understand, they want to repeat it until I hear and understand. Then if I don't understand a certain part that the lecturer has explained, my friend is willing to repeat the lecturer's explanation, explaining it to me until I understand." (FN, WhatsApp Interview, 8th April 2023)

Of course, the diversity of assistance that FN received was inseparable from FN's response to the environment, which was always open to its circumstances. What's more, many people can also easily recognize the lack of FN just by looking at the use of BTE (Behind the Ear) behind the ear. Namely, a hearing aid that is most commonly used by deaf people.

"These BTEs that I'm currently wearing in my ears are a kind of hearing aid. Short for behind the ear, if I'm not mistaken. The model of the assistive device used behind the ear. This is

⁵ FN, Interview by Researcher, on April 8, 2023, interview 3, FN-32 Transcript

⁶ FN, Interview by Researcher, on March 17, 2023, interview 1, FN-13 Transcript

⁷ FN, Interview by Researcher, on April 8, 2023, interview 3, FN-34 Transcript

the model most commonly used by deaf people. <u>It's just that I use the headscarf</u>. So, the only people who know are my <u>female friends</u>. See, this is not too visible from behind the headscarf. But from up close it's pretty obvious, right? It's a bit prominent. So that's what my friends are more aware of when I visit my friend's boarding house or friends who visit at my house. Then, when I don't wear the hijab anymore, they look at my BTE." (FN, Interview, 17th March 2023)

Likewise with English listening material. This material is of course very dependent on the ability of the sense of hearing in the form of ears. Fundamentally, this material requires good listening skills and is accompanied by commensurate English skills. However, FN's condition as hard of hearing certainly hindered the learning process so it was very challenging. Fortunately, the morphology material can help FN in applying the ability to read gestures and lip movements. Of course, in certain situations, this technique may not apply. Especially if the listening material provided is only in the form of audio alone. So in the end, the best step that FN can take is to have further discussions with friends and lecturers.

"Of course, it is very challenging for me as a deaf person to learn listening. But with other materials in learning English, such as morphology, it really helps. This lesson really helped me in learning to listen. I don't just rely on hearing but seeing the mouth movements of native speakers. Keep on gesturing to them too. But if the lecturer only provides audio, without pictures, videos, or a transcript, then that's when I really had a hard time. Just imagine that I am being told to listen to audio only, there are no subtitles, even though I tried to listen to it using my hearing needs, so I feel dizzy. Sometimes I think it's messy. I don't know whether the transcript that I made or the conclusion that I heard from the audio is true or not. That's very awkward for me. Even though my hearing aid is quite helpful, it's not enough for learning listening which in my opinion is quite complex. That's why I will once again ask for the help of my fellow students and lecturers concerned regarding directions from the instructions in the audio or

 $^{^{8}}$ FN, Interview by Researcher, on March 17, 2023, interview 1, FN-10 Transcript

<u>discussion about the causes.</u> How can the audio content discuss that, that's it?" (FN, Interview, 17th March 2023)

Regarding the listening challenge itself, FN revealed several difficult situations. These situations include varying audio sound quality and lack of vocabulary memorization. In addition, FN also admitted that her hearing impairment made it more difficult for FN to distinguish audio content if the pronunciation taken was similar to the pronunciation of other words. Especially if the accents of the voice actors are combined, FN will be even more misunderstood. So FN herself tends to prefer asking for transcripts from the lecturer.

"About unclear audio problems, that's for sure. The audio quality is different. Some are good and clear, and some are noisy. On the other hand, there are also those whose recording quality is really low so it's not clear. But the problem is that I don't memorize the vocabulary and my hearing isn't optimal. So if I listen to listening, it's like I'm tired by myself. Not yet, it feels like I want to give up first. What's the problem? If you ask, am I listening to the audio? Sure I listen. It's just what the native said in the audio, you know, I don't understand. For example, the audio says "on across". At first, I thought the audio said "all alone." Far away right? Yes, that's a fact. Sometimes it's really shy, between one word and another actually has a different vocabulary. But, just because the pronunciation is a bit similar, my understanding immediately messed up. My ears can't filter out similar words in English. Especially native speakers, when they talk, they like to mix words up. Dragged. In fact, the potential for misunderstanding is greater if it's not clarified with an audio transcript. That's why sometimes I dare to go to the lecturer to ask for a transcript or ask for an outline of the contents of the audio. And fortunately, most lecturers are willing to provide transcripts."¹⁰ (FN, WhatsApp Interview, 8th April 2023)

The reason for requesting the transcript itself was that discussions with friends did not find a clear spot. Meanwhile, FN is also quite close to many lecturers so most lecturers are willing to personally provide transcripts or just provide the gist of the audio content which helps make it easier for FN to digest the audio context.

31

⁹ FN, Interview by Researcher, on March 17, 2023, interview 1, FN-16 Transcript ¹⁰ FN, Interview by Researcher, on April 8, 2023, interview 3, FN-36 Transcript

"Sometimes when I get stuck, I get confused, discussions with friends seem to get stuck, and I have to ask the lecturers. Besides, the lecturer happens to be pretty close to me, right? Especially after they know my situation like this. So, from there, the lecturer helped me personally by giving me the transcript. Sometimes it even helps typing the contents of the audio for me. Even though it's not complete enough, it really helps. I'm really bothersome, right? Luckily, they are patient. Therefore, I am very grateful to my lecturer for patiently helping me. And always be patient even though I'm really troublesome." (FN, Interview, 17th March 2023)

If the message she gave to the lecturer in question was not responded to, FN even dared to go directly to the lecturer's room to clarify the assignment given. Of course, FN is not alone. Her friend accompanied such a process.

"If I discuss it with friends I also do not understand. Or even have different perceptions. As a result, I had to chat with the lecturer directly. What kind of work do you mean, sir? Or what does this material mean, sir? If I don't get a reply, sometimes I try to meet them, you know. Even when I passed them on the street or in the lecturer's room, to ask. Yes, you know. The lecturer should be busy, right? They don't have to have time to reply to students' WhatsApp. What's more if the explanation is needed. That's why you really have to take the initiative to meet in person. There, he usually takes the time to explain to me about his assignment. There were even some who immediately looked very sympathetic to me after knowing my condition and my efforts so they wanted to meet in person. And maybe I wouldn't have done all of that if I wasn't accompanied by my friends. It's just that some lecturers are a bit apathetic, and don't want to know about the condition of their students." 12 (FN, WhatsApp Interview, 8th April 2023)

Moreover, FN's tenacity was also increasingly seen in several situations. That is, when there are difficult subjects accompanied by heavy lecture demands, FN will discuss with the closest lecturers to ask for a solution. This step is taken if the lecturer concerned is

 $^{^{11}}$ FN, Interview by Researcher, on March 17, 2023, interview 1, FN-17 Transcript

¹² FN, Interview by Researcher, on April 8, 2023, interview 3, FN-37 Transcript

reluctant to understand the conditions and difficulties of FN during lectures. From the discussions that FN had with her familiar lecturer, the lecturer usually gave certain suggestions or helped persuade the lecturer concerned. FN said she was grateful to join the organization so she could get to know many lecturers who were willing to help and support FN in many fields.

"In fact, some students can't just adapt easily. That's why there was a lecturer that I persuaded, I explained my condition, but I was still ignorant. Sometimes it's hard until I stress myself because it's hard to adjust to his lectures. The demands in the class are also quite heavy. So if I'm really stuck, I have to get close to the lecturer. Close to lecturers, in the sense that some of my lecturers are really close to me, right? Then he also understood my less normal situation. From there, I sometimes ask for solutions to problems with other lecturers who don't want to understand. Sometimes they are encouraged, and sometimes they are even helped to talk to the lecturer. From there it felt, O Allah, thank God I have such a good lecturer. It's not in vain that I know a lot of people who join campus organizations. So I can get close to good lecturers and want to help. But that's only once. Often, if I explained the condition to the lecturer in question, he would immediately understand and be more understanding. Many also want to help during lectures."¹³ (FN, WhatsApp Interview, 8th April 2023)

One of the supports that FN gets from the organizational environment is several useful recommendations to facilitate lectures. An example is the recommendation to use the speech-to-text feature to get a better understanding of listening to lectures.

"So, at first I just kind of went along with it, gradually I could really mingle, I got to know a lot of people, and was always recommended the best ways to attend lectures. For example, while listening to the lecturer's explanation, I'm turning on the speech-to-text feature on my cell phone. So, if there is an explanation from a lecturer or friend who is giving a presentation, I can understand it better while listening to the speech-to-text recording." ¹⁴ (FN, WhatsApp Interview, 8th April 2023)

¹³ FN, Interview by Researcher, on April 8, 2023, interview 3, FN-37 Transcript

¹⁴ FN, Interview by Researcher, on April 8, 2023, interview 3, FN-32 Transcript

This feature is commonly used by the visually impaired to convert voice messages into text messages without the need to type. Meanwhile, this feature is specifically used by FN to capture lecturer explanations into text form so that it can be re-read if there are parts of the discussion that are not understood or are not heard.

"So, speech-to-text is actually an application that is often used by the blind to write. For example, if you chat with them in WA (Whatsapp), I'm supposed to be blind. Well, that's enough for me to reply to you, just use my voice. No need to type. When typing, you have to need the vision to see the keyboard, right? So, if you use an application or speech-totext feature, you don't need to type anymore. All you have to do is talk, then your voice will be recorded in written form. So don't be surprised if there are people who are said to be blind but can still reply to WA or chat in written form. You see, they take advantage of the speech-to-text feature. Then, if I'm myself, I'm not too painstaking when I listen to the lecturer's explanation. Moreover, I generally use English when studying. Where is my seat, I also like to corner with my close friends. That's why one way for me to balance myself in lectures is to use the speech-to-text feature. So, what lecturers or friends present will be recorded in writing and I can read it again if something seems doesn't understand."15 (FN, WhatsApp Interview, 8th April 2023)

It is just that this feature has significant drawbacks if this feature is activated in a room that is too crowded or too far from the presenter. So again, the best step to clarify understanding of FN is to expand friendship relations and have many discussions.

"The only drawback is that if the distance is too far or the class is too crowded, it can't be accurate. So this kind of assistance is not the main adjustment medium. Back and forth, the best adaptation process is from me. Make lots of friends, discuss with friends, and join organizations. That's me." ¹⁶ (FN, WhatsApp Interview, 8th April 2023)

Meanwhile, FN admitted that she had an impressive experience while studying at a regular campus. That is when FN is

 $^{^{15}}$ FN, Interview by Researcher, on April 8, 2023, interview 3, FN-33 Transcript

¹⁶ FN, Interview by Researcher, on April 8, 2023, interview 3, FN-33 Transcript

given a special session to talk with native speaker guests. As a deaf person, FN felt treated well.

"The most memorable thing for me as a deaf person learning English at university was when our campus had native-speaker guests. At that time I was given the opportunity to communicate with a speaker. It is very extraordinary for me as a deaf person to have such an opportunity. And I am not looked down upon, in fact, I am treated better. So it really feels amazing, with hearing impairments, even given a special session to talk directly with native speakers. Duh, especially the foreigner is also very handsome. Auto gets melted. Until now, I can't forget those experiences." (FN, Interview, 17th March 2023)

The joy is described in the form of satisfaction after being able to hear a native speaker speak directly in front of her. An impression that makes FN feels valued by those around her. Indirectly, this is moral support that not everyone can get.

"I'm sure it's fun. It feels like a dream to be able to talk directly with live audio. Ha ha ha. Just imagine, usually in the listening class we only hear their voices without being face to face, then we can hear them speak English directly in front of us. That feels amazing, sure. This is seen by many students and lecturers too. Although I'm not that smart. I am just a little different from them. Feels like I really got appreciated. It's really regrettable if I've never been colonized that turns out as cool as this." (FN, Interview, 17th March 2023)

From this experience, FN came to know that listening to English audio has a different impact than chatting with native speakers directly. For FN, talking with native speakers is clearer and easier to understand than just listening to audio. In this case, it should be listening to audio material.

"So that's what makes me speechless. <u>If I listen via audio, sometimes it's not too clear.</u> It's hard to understand also. <u>But in fact, if you talk directly, it's clear.</u> Maybe there is influence <u>from the microphone so the sound is loud and clear.</u> So most of what native speakers say I understand. Even though I spoke

¹⁷ FN, Interview by Researcher, on March 17, 2023, interview 1, FN-19 Transcript

¹⁸ FN, Interview by Researcher, on March 17, 2023, interview 1, FN-20 Transcript

convulsively because I was not fluent in speaking."¹⁹ (FN, Interview, 17th March 2023)

In a special talk session that FN did with a native speaker, the speaker gave FN advice on learning how to listen through an app or web called elllo. This application can help FN increase her perception of listening material because it has a lot of audio or video that is compatible with the transcript.

"I really remember talking to a native speaker, and then he asked me about my condition. I was given a pretty good recommendation, in my opinion. He gave me information about an app or web recommendations for learning listening which I think are really good. So, that's the name of the website, elllo.org.id or if you search on the AppStore, it's also there. The application name is elllo too. In the application, it's nice to be able to listen to audio, there's a transcript, and there are also some listening questions. In fact, it's not just audio. There is a video, and examples of conversations are also available. Anyway, it's really helpful." (FN, Interview, 17th March 2023)

For FN itself, the elllo application is different from YouTube. Given that YouTube transcripts are generated automatically, it is possible to have subtitles that do not conform to the contents of the conversation. Transcripts on elllo are more reliable and can vary knowledge of English accents with speakers from different countries. Including the way of speaking and their intonation. Audio articulation in elllo also varies. Some are clear and some are not. So, that it can be studied and listened to according to the level of listening proficiency.

"It's different, I think. The subtitles on YouTube are automatic. If we pay close attention, many subtitles don't match with the speakers are saying. It's different from Ello. If it's elllo, the transcript matches the audio. So, the validity of context and content must be guaranteed. That's the first. Second, in the elllo application, there are various voice actors. They are from America, New Zealand, England, Canada, and even the Philippines. So, if we often hear the way native people speak English directly, we become more aware of their

_

 $^{^{\}rm 19}$ FN, Interview by Researcher, on March 17, 2023, interview 1, FN-21 Transcript

²⁰ FN, Interview by Researcher, on March 17, 2023, interview 1, FN-24 Transcript

acsen of speaking, how to read, to their intonation. Not to mention, there are really various learning techniques. There are those whose audio is clear and the articulation is clear, and there are also those which are really similar to ordinary audio listening. That is, the talk dragged on and on, it was not too clear, and that's it."²¹ (FN, Interview, 17th March 2023)

From this application, everyone can learn to listen even if they are deaf. If the results cannot be as good as normal people, at least the listening ability of the deaf can also develop.

"You can learn in-depth with the application even though it's not as perfect as other people's. We are the same, they are the same also. Both come to campus to study. We have the same opportunity to reach the future even though we have obstacles."²² (FN, Interview, 17th March 2023)

FN took these steps because there was no awareness on the part of the campus to facilitate persons with disabilities (consideration).

"The regular campus does not have facilities and infrastructure to support disabilities. There is no awareness of the campus to provide this. Especially for the deaf."23 (FN, Interview, 17th March 2023)

Moreover, the surrounding environment also rarely realizes deaf people if they are not conveyed directly (concession). Therefore, in any way, it is FN herself who must take the initiative to follow lectures with smart methods that she can do. Including using certain features or collaborating with friends as previously stated.

"Moreover, a deaf person like me is often not realized by many people. So, the teaching and learning process that I go through on campus such as most regular campuses. Likewise, the media used by lecturers. I am a deaf person, like it or not, should just be smart enough to follow the lessons provided by the lecturers."²⁴ (FN, Interview, 17th March 2023)

²¹ FN, Interview by Researcher, on March 17, 2023, interview 1, FN-25 Transcript

²² FN, Interview by Researcher, on March 17, 2023, interview 1, FN-25 Transcript ²³ FN, Interview by Researcher, on March 17, 2023, interview 1, FN-14 Transcript

However, listening to English still brings benefits such as improving skills to deal with TOEFL and IELTS that will be useful for the public interest, especially when applying for scholarships.

"As a human being, of course, there are many benefits of listening on campus. In addition to improving skills and abilities, students also need this to take the TOEFL and IELTS exams. Moreover, international TOEFL scores are also important for applying for scholarships. It's either for national scholarships or international scholarships especially. For example, wanting to work abroad is also important, right. In addition, in my opinion, the most difficult session in the TOEFL or IELTS test is the listening session. So, I'm very grateful that there are listening materials on campus, so there are lots of changes." (FN, Interview, 17th March 2023)

That is why FN hopes that deaf students are willing to try to study harder so they can adapt. There is no shame in asking for help because nobody is perfect.

"We are deaf; we are different from other student friends. We have to work harder and study harder so we can keep up with others and not inconvenience others. Do not be like me, often lazy. Learning is also lacking, so it is a bit regretful too. Also, do not be shy about asking friends and lecturers for help when you have trouble learning. After all, no matter what, there is no such thing as a perfect human being. Isn't it?" ²⁶ (FN, Interview, 17th March 2023)

2. RA Experiences in Listening Classroom

RA became a deaf student who lived a normal college life. This student who graduated from the private Kudus campus admitted that she did not feel anxious when studying at the regular campus because she was used to taking formal education in regular classes. The momentary feeling of inferiority experienced is considered something normal as long as it does not interfere with lectures.

"Actually, it's indifferent for me. <u>Because from the beginning</u>, <u>I also went to regular school</u>. The kindergarten is regular, elementary school is regular, and MA (Islamic senior high school) is also regular. <u>So actually it was normal when I</u>

²⁶ FN, Interview by Researcher, on March 17, 2023, interview 1, FN-26 Transcript

 $^{^{25}}$ FN, Interview by Researcher, on March 17, 2023, interview 1, FN-22 Transcript

started studying on campus. What's more, I'm only deaf to the <u>left</u>. So, it's alhamdulillah that I can still adapt to the lecture environment. At least it's just a little insecurity at the <u>beginning</u>. But after a while, it's also normal. Especially when you find a friend with the same frequency. So just enjoy it more in studying."²⁷ (RA, Interview, 12th March 2023)

RA believes that normal students with deaf students can study in the same place even though feelings of inferiority still exist. Especially not everyone can adapt quickly.

"Yeah, it's okay actually. Deaf people and ordinary people can go to the same college. In fact, students who have limited hearing like me can still get the same material as my friends. Yes, even though it feels quite strange when you have to deal with other people who don't have limitations. What's more, not everyone can quickly adapt to differences, nor are they willing to adapt to people who have limitations like me." RA, Interview, 12th March 2023)

Even so, RA can enjoy the adaptation process in the campus environment well. Moreover, not everyone is immediately aware of RA's hearing loss. RA is also still able to communicate naturally through efforts to read gestures and lip movements so some of them only realize her shortcomings after RA confesses to them.

"Oh, if there's a problem like that, it shouldn't be. My physical appearance is like a normal person. Alhamdulillah, that my hands and feet are still intact. My eyes can see too, right? So yeah, they don't really know, maybe. Especially if I communicate that I concentrate on many senses. It's not only the sense of hearing but also the sense of sight. For example, like reading lips. That's the most common form of communication used by deaf people. While a deaf person like me may not be able to hear clearly what another person is saying, it doesn't necessarily mean that they can't understand what is being communicated. In fact, my friends did not immediately know that I was deaf. At least, when we first met, they didn't know that. However, when I have difficulty reading their lips or body movements, they seem to feel that I have difficulty communicating with them. Sometimes, when

²⁸ RA, Interview by Researcher, on March 12, 2023, interview 2, RA-6 Transcript

 $^{^{\}rm 27}$ RA, Interview by Researcher, on March 12, 2023, interview 2, RA-5 Transcript

I admit that I have a hearing loss, they just say something like this, "Oh no wonder it's hard to answer when someone calls you. But you don't look like that in any way. Just like a normal person." Or they also say, "No wonder sometimes your answer doesn't go along with me, sis." A bit ironic, but the truth is like that. How else?"²⁹ (RA, Interview, 12th March 2023)

The treatment that RA got from friends and lecturers is reasonable. Apart from that many do not know RA's condition; RA itself also asks to be treated normally by parties who know her shortcomings. This aims to reduce discomfort while interacting.

"So, I asked friends and lecturers who knew my condition not to think of me as a "special" student or as someone who needed special treatment from them. Maybe there will be a slightly different way of communicating with me. However, I have also gotten used to building natural communication networks. The rest, I asked them to treat me normally because things like that can make me and them uncomfortable when interacting. Also, I also find it more difficult to adapt." (RA, Interview, 12th March 2023)

It is just that some people who know the condition of RA tend to still try to compensate for the condition of RA when interacting. This special treatment can be seen from the way they talk to RA; raise the intonation to be heard & and invite to speak in a private place away from the crowd. But because RA has proven its ability to mingle like normal people, RA does emphasize being treated normally.

"Some people gave me special treats, some did not. It depends. Moreover, I also have limitations that can still be tolerated. The point is, when it comes to special treatment, at first, they treat me like someone who deserves and needs attention. They feel like they're feeling sad when they talk and lift their voices so I can hear their voice. Also, they often invite me to have private conversations so that what is conveyed is not hindered by loud noises from the surrounding environment. Although, in fact, I can continue my life the same way as everyone else. So yes, I asked them to treat me

³⁰ RA, Interview by Researcher, on March 12, 2023, interview 2, RA-8 Transcript

40

²⁹ RA, Interview by Researcher, on March 12, 2023, interview 2, RA-7 Transcript

<u>like an ordinary person</u>. Especially in communication time. Whether it's on the phone, participating in group discussions, or just chatting. The important thing I should do when I communicate is to always focus." ³¹ (RA, Interview, 12th March 2023)

Apart from not receiving special treatment from other people, RA herself also did not have a problem with the learning media used by her lecturers. The public media used by the lecturer still helps RA attend lectures well. Moreover, RA only underwent offline lectures for 3 semesters so she prioritized the use of online-based electronic media during lectures. RA only believes that any media is useful in facilitating deaf students' learning while being used appropriately. Students only need to determine the best effective media to help improve their comprehension skills.

"I think my lecturer still uses media that are commonly used by most lecturers. Apart from many lecturers who don't know my condition, of course, the lecturer also pays attention to the general scope of lectures where the average learners are also normal people. What is certain is audio, projectors, online learning applications, and books. Like that. Especially when it's already a pandemic, right? It's like we study offline for only 3 semesters, after that we go online. So, during the pandemic, the use of electronic media seemed to be an important component in the daily learning process. Therefore, the emphasis on learning really depends on me, whether I want to study independently or not. What is certain is that I always believed that all the media would be very helpful for deaf people like me. Especially the way we review some of the material at the end of class. For example, it's like watching learning videos from lecturers again, listening to the material or making material using earphones. Sometimes I also save audio explanations of material, record material explanations, then take advantage of the visual appearance that the lecturer uses when teaching. Various types of educational media like that are quite helpful for me to understand which way is most effective for me to understand the subject matter is simply a way to minimize obstacles."32 (RA, Interview, 12th March 2023)

³² RA, Interview by Researcher, on March 12, 2023, interview 2, RA-10 Transcript

³¹ RA, Interview by Researcher, on March 12, 2023, interview 2, RA-9 Transcript

For RA personally, listening is indeed the most difficult subject. RA needs a lot of time to understand conversations, explanations, and debates in English. Even hearing in Indonesian, RA often has difficulty. Especially if the audience is too crowded, so the presenter's voice becomes unclear. Loud or soft sounds also greatly affect RA hearing. Moreover, if there are no images or movements to support the conversation, the RA will have difficulty predicting the audio content.

"Yes, that's right. Listening is the most difficult subject in my opinion. The problem is that there are a lot of time constraints trying to understand conversations, lectures, or debates that occur in English. Forget about English, even in Indonesian, I often experience several difficulties. The difficulties, for example, are because the audience environment is too crowded. It could also happen when the presenter's voice is not clear. Or maybe even both. A situation like that is really hard for me. Listening in silence is a bit difficult. Especially when the place is so crowded. The problem is, the factors that affect the results of our hearing are varied. For example, depending on the speed of the speaker's speech, the presence of noise around, then, for example, speaking without any pictures or movements that support the conversation. So, if there are parts of someone's speech that I don't understand, I can't predict what other people (in audio) are saying."33 (RA, Interview, 12th March 2023)

Another challenge arises from the tempo speed and audio quality. This includes limited vocabulary that makes it difficult for RA to digest the entire contents of the audio. Usually, the RA only understands half of the contents of the conversation so it has to be played repeatedly to get the main topic according to the contents of the conversation.

"In addition to the speed of speech as loud as the softness of the sound, there are also many hearing-inhibiting factors. Especially listening to English. For example, just listen to audio. If the audio sound quality is not good, it will automatically be more difficult for me to digest the audio content. Not to mention, however, my English vocabulary skills are also limited. So, if there is a lot of listening with similar words, I will be confused about whether to talk about

³³ RA, Interview by Researcher, on March 12, 2023, interview 2, RA-12 Transcript

A or talk about B like that. Then sometimes half understand the conversation, and the other half I don't understand because of a lack of vocabulary. So I was confused by the essence of the conversation. Hearing problems with my condition like this is quite a struggle for me personally. So it's definitely hard for me. For example, audio or video is provided, right? I still have to play it many times while imagining the words that are most relevant to the topic or something similar to my point of view about the conversation. Well, at least this can make it easier for me a little before I can understand what is being said in the tape."³⁴ (RA, Interview, 12th March 2023)

Regarding the involvement of friends or lecturers, RA herself admitted that her friends and lecturers were good. RA friends are willing to be invited to discuss material and assignments; the lecturer is also willing to explain again if there are questions from RA while the lesson is still ongoing. It is just that RA always tries to re-learn learning material independently to anticipate continuous dependence on other parties. Moreover, virtual learning certainly greatly limits RA's interactions with friends and lecturers.

"Yes, alhamdulillah, my lecturers and friends are good. So, if I have difficulty understanding the lecturer's explanation, sure. But no matter what, I always try to anticipate that things like that don't happen too often. One of them is, for example, reading material before lectures, then I also have to focus when listening to lectures. But, if I still have something that I don't understand, I usually try to read it again or discuss it with my friends about the material or assignments that have been given. But, if by chance it's still during the lecturer's lecture hours, and given the opportunity to ask questions, I'll ask. So when I'm having trouble following the lecturer's explanation, I will ask the lecturer to re-explain the parts that I don't understand. But yeah, it's rare. Only a few lecturers are aware of and understand my limitations. Most of the time, I try to re-learn on my own. Unless I'm given an assignment that I think I should ask directly to the lecturer, then I ask for an explanation or ask something like that."35 (RA, Interview, 12th March 2023)

³⁴ RA, Interview by Researcher, on March 12, 2023, interview 2, RA-13 Transcript

³⁵ RA, Interview by Researcher, on March 12, 2023, interview 2, RA-14 Transcript

Basically, RA must focus during lectures in order to achieve the target of her lectures. The trick is to sit around students who are not fussy. RA is not too concerned about the learning system that forces her to act normally because she has been used to dealing with similar situations since childhood.

"I must be self-employed. One of them, in college, <u>I like to take a seat that is a bit quiet or near friends who don't talk too much. So, I can focus more when listening to the material</u>. If there are no lecturers, just have lots of discussions with friends. That's it. How else? It's like saying that <u>I've been used to dealing with situations like this since I was little, so it's like I hardly ever take it seriously</u>. Always try to put it e like most people."³⁶ (RA, Interview, 12th March 2023)

From the development process that RA underwent, RA recommended the use of YouTube and English films as media for developing listening skills. Listeners can watch the video using the transcript feature to help deepen their English skills. From there, listeners can learn the correct pronunciation and enrich their vocabulary.

"I think that for the deaf it will be easier to learn to listen if we use the English transcript feature on YouTube or foreign films like that. If the lack of hearing impairment includes difficulty distinguishing the vocabulary spoken by a narrator like me, we can use this feature to deepen our English skills. So later you can think, oh if someone say this in a native speaker, it will be like that, right? And that can help. This includes enriching vocabulary." (RA, Interview, 12th March 2023)

RA also likes challenges. Learning English with its limitations does require more effort. However, RA enjoys learning new things like English which requires more practice. Even though English is not her mother tongue, RA still studies it because she likes English.

"The point is I like challenges. So, for me, learning a new language is a venture worth trying. Learning a foreign language like this is not like learning other subjects that can be learned just by reading. But it also takes a lot of practice

³⁷ RA, Interview by Researcher, on March 12, 2023, interview 2, RA-21 Transcript

_

³⁶ RA, Interview by Researcher, on March 12, 2023, interview 2, RA-14 Transcript

and self-practices. So when it comes to English, there are a lot of impressive things. The point is challenging because the position of English is not the mother tongue, but a second language. Or even the position of English which can be said as a foreign language. But yes, because I like English, I still do it." (RA, Interview, 12th March 2023)

What makes learning English on campus memorable is the learning model that is different from the high school level. In lectures, there is more practice and material development for the further education level. Learning at the university is also more intense. Including efforts to introduce culture related to English. So that RA felt traveling the world only through books or presenter explanations.

"This is because I've been doing it for a long time too. Starting from the seventh grade of MTs and continuing until you graduate from campus, right? If you count how many years it will be? 7, 8, 9, 10. So I studied English for a total of 10 years. And what makes learning English on campus memorable is the learning model. It turns out that it's different from when I was still on the MTs (Islamic junior high school) or MA (Islamic senior high school) bench. On campus, there are more practices and skill development, and the materials are also expanding. So it can develop the process of the next level of education. In addition, I became more serious about studying. Even though my listening skills are still very bad, let's say, some even got a C too. What is clear is that learning English on campus is more intense than at school. And from that campus provision, I am still trying to improve my fluency. Even to this day, I still learn the language. After all, mastering a new language takes a lifetime. Oh yes, there are also impressive ones. If you are on campus, you will know more about culture. The name of language cannot be separated from culture. So, when learning English, it also mentions more about related cultures to make sure students understand the context of the material or not. It's quite interesting because it feels like you can travel around the world, without actually having to travel around the world, you

³⁸ RA, Interview by Researcher, on March 12, 2023, interview 2, RA-17 Transcript

know. Even if you just read a book or listen to a presentation."³⁹ (RA, Interview, 12th March 2023)

Regarding the benefits of listening, RA only revealed these benefits in general. That is to help bridge communication globally in any interest. Listening to English also opens opportunities to enter the bigger world. This also includes RA's self-use for business interests.

"About the benefits of listening, in general. The point is <u>if you</u> want to communicate on a global scale, you need English. English is like a bridge. Not only connecting individuals but also nations and countries. Needed everywhere, right? Starting from business, trade, politics, sports, and fashion. Anyway, the sector is evenly distributed. So, <u>English</u>, including listening as well, opens wide opportunities to enter work on a larger scale. For example, you own a business, right, so you can connect or discuss agreements with foreign clients. The results of learning listening while on campus are very useful for me to develop websites or virtual meetings with clients from abroad." (RA, Interview, 12th March 2023)

Finally, RA suggests respecting one another and not discriminating against other people's weaknesses. Especially with the existence of various gadgets and medical treatments in the modern era, deaf people don't need to worry too much and still have to be confident. Whatever they want can be pursued because everyone has the opportunity as long as they want to try.

"The point is hearing loss in certain individuals may be rectified with the use of technological gadgets or medical treatment. For example cochlear implants or as simple as hearing aids. But the most important thing is that we understand and respect each other. There's no perfect human. All complement each other's shortcomings. Always be a good person who doesn't discriminate against people's shortcomings or circumstances. Then, deaf people like me, also have to stay confident. Don't be shy. Whatever it is that you want to pursue in college, just pursue it. Want to enter the Arabic language, business, or English, all are welcome. Opportunities are always there. Especially now that there are

⁴⁰ RA, Interview by Researcher, on March 12, 2023, interview 2, RA-19 Transcript

_

³⁹ RA, Interview by Researcher, on March 12, 2023, interview 2, RA-17 Transcript

many different types of hearing aids. So, everyone can get the same opportunity if we want to try."41 (RA, Interview, 12th March 2023)

B. Discussions

Based on the results that the researcher has obtained from the data above, the researcher will reveal the context of the answers from the previous research question which discusses the experiences that deaf students got when using the English listening method in EFL classes and future recommendations for deaf learning. This discussion begins with the existence of social issues regarding RA and FN conditions based on everyday life situations.

FN stated, "... I was sent to SDLB (elementary special school) near my house here. ...", "... Even though I got some missed lessons academically from my friends, my mother was happy because I was able to socialize naturally with people. Continue to college."

RA stated, "... Because from the beginning, I also went to regular school ..."

Both of these participants have the same condition which shows that they have one side hearing impairment so they still got normal conversations. Even more, they can still interact with normal people in their environment. Just like research that has conducted on 96 campuses, deaf people can still communicate with normal students whether with hearing aids or not. Although it was found that users of hearing aids are indeed better at reception and production of communication skills. 42 This is evident from the story of them coming from regular schools from the elementary school level to entering the university level.

However, FN revealed that before entering a regular academy, she had studied at a special needs school near her home. FN was placed in a special class for the deaf and speech impaired. It is just that education in special schools did not last long because her parents were concerned about the growth and development of children's

Objective measures and self-assessment. Journal of Communication Disorders, 75, 2018,

⁴¹ RA, Interview by Researcher, on March 12, 2023, interview 2, RA-22 Transcript 42 Spencer, L. J., Marschark, M., Machmer, E., Durkin, A., Borgna, G., & Convertino, C. Communication skills of deaf and hard-of-hearing college students:

communication with the social environment. That is, if FN gets used to using sign language to communicate, it will be difficult for FN to communicate verbally with ordinary people. Meanwhile, when she was little, FN was trained by her parents to speak verbally even though she had problems such as speech delay or delays in cognitive aspects.

FN stated, "... <u>I don't just rely on hearing but seeing the mouth movements of native speakers.</u> <u>Keep on gesturing to them too.</u> ..."

RA stated, "... <u>Especially if I communicate that I concentrate on many senses</u>. It's not only the sense of hearing but also the sense of sight. ..."

The process of communication in everyday life is also going well because both of them not only hear with their ears but also use their sense of sight to read gestures and lip movements. Moreover, they also have morphology courses that can maximize their ability to read the lips of the other person. Here she puts forward an idea of how the brain processes complex words; she investigated how she make reading lip easier and influence brain activity using eye movement. So she shapes the brain's mathematical models of language.⁴³

FN stated, "I feel very happy ...", "... Fortunately, my classmates when I was in high school came to the same campus ..."

RA stated, "... At least it's just a little insecurity at the beginning. But after a while, it's also normal ..."

From the experience of both of them after going through a long process of regular education at the formal level, both RA and FN felt that the world of lectures was not scary. This is because both of them are used to placing themselves in an ordinary environment even though a little feeling of inferiority had appeared. FN felt happy while RA felt normal in the lecture environment. FN's courage was encouraged by the support from parents and classmates who also happened to continue their education at the same campus. Especially after FN was invited by her friends to join the organization so that she could be close to her friends and new lecturers.

⁴³ Crepaldi, Davide. Linguistic Morphology in the Mind and Brain. *Current issues in Psychology of Language*. 248. ISBN 9780367679583. 2023.

RA stated, "... <u>I can continue my life the same way as everyone</u> else. So yes, I asked them to treat me like an ordinary person. ..."

Meanwhile, RA has good enough independence so that she can continue her education properly even without depending on many parties. Moreover, RA herself tends not to reveal her identity as deaf to many people including friends and lecturers. So that the lecture period which is mostly done online, is always pursued independently. Online learning basically requires good regulation and independence to achieve the educational goals being held.⁴⁴ RA asked more friends who knew about her situation to treat her fairly so that she got comfortable interacting.

RA stated, "... <u>I always try to anticipate that things like that don't happen too often.</u> ..."

The characteristics that have built by the two of them since they were small also form habits when they are in college. Namely, both RA and FN can go through lectures smoothly even though they still need the help of friends and lecturers when they encounter difficulties. The difference is that RA always tries to do all assignments independently by reading material before class, reviewing material after class, or extending references outside class hours. As previous research stated that pre-learning before is indeed very helpful in providing better learning outcomes. Only if it is not understood, RA will discuss it with friends or ask the lecturer while still in class.

FN stated, "If I discuss it with friends I also do not understand. Or even have different perceptions. As a result, I had to chat with the lecturer directly. ..."

In contrast to RA, FN tends to follow learning according to her ability and then asks her friends when she does not understand. If asking friends she still did not understand or even found a different perception, then FN will ask the lecturer directly. The chosen method is to contact via WhatsApp or ask directly. FN went to the lecturer in his room to

49

⁴⁴ Cho, M.-H., Kim, Y., & Choi, D. The effect of self-regulated learning on college students' perceptions of community of inquiry and affective outcomes in online learning. *The Internet and Higher Education*, 34, 2017. 10–17. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.iheduc.2017.04.001

⁴⁵ Chen, T., Luo, H., Wang, P., Yin, X., & Yang, J. (2023). The role of pre-class and in-class behaviors in predicting learning performance and experience in flipped classrooms. *Heliyon*, 9(4), e15234. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2023.e15234

ask questions about material or assignments that she had not understood.

FN stated, "... it is very challenging for me as a deaf person to learn listening. ..."

RA stated, "... <u>Listening is the most difficult subject in my opinion.</u> ..."

The researcher obtained from the participants, both RA and FN admitted that listening was a difficult subject for them. Their condition as deaf still shows the consequence of the difficulty of understanding English listening. Primarily, English is not the mother tongue, but a foreign language. ⁴⁶ Pupillary response does help deaf improve sensitivity in listening context. ⁴⁷ However, in general, audio that was shared for listening rarely showed videos or photos as a visualization of audio content. Therefore, understanding of RA and FN is increasingly limited due to the lack of vocabulary memorization. However, RA and FN were also not too concerned about their less-than-optimal listening scores. This is because they realize that their hearing limitations cannot be prosecuted further.

FN stated, "... About unclear audio problems, that's for sure. The audio quality is different. ..."

RA stated, "... If the audio sound quality is not good, it will automatically be more difficult for me to digest the audio content. ..."

In addition, FN and RA also confirmed that audio quality greatly influences their understanding of audio content. The audio volume that is too low makes FN and RA unable to digest the vocabulary chosen by the speakers. They could only hear but did not know what the speaker was saying. Moreover, native speakers tend to combine the pronunciation of several words, making it more difficult for them to understand the actual context. In fact, speaking natively directly was not as complicated as listening. FN gave a different fact about her

⁴⁶ Cao, Y. K., & Wei, W. Willingness to communicate from an English as an International Language (EIL) perspective: The case of Macau. System, 2019, 102149. doi:10.1016/j.system.2019.102149

⁴⁷ Wendt, D., & Lunner, T. The effect of hearing impairment, hearing aid technology and task difficulty on listening effort as indicated by the pupillary response. *International Journal of Psychophysiology*, 2018. *131*, S23. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijpsycho.2018.07.071

experience when she heard a native speaker speaking directly in front of her using a microphone. FN admitted that she did not find it difficult to digest the speaker's speech even though it was in full English. This means that loud sound and good audio quality have a big impact on FN understanding.

Differences in accent and its effect on listening comprehension have been explained in previous research regarding 'mismatched interlanguage speech intelligibility detriment' that non-native speakers tend to find it more difficult to understand speech from native speakers than from fellow non-native speakers. ⁴⁸ That's why listening to native speakers through audio becomes more complex due to other challenging factors such as unclear audio quality or insufficient audio volume for deaf students.

Furthermore, RA also expressed her opinion that audio that is not clear and without visual assistance is indeed difficult. This situation forced RA to play audio repeatedly while imagining vocabulary that was relevant to the topic. So, if there were two or more similar pronunciations, RA can determine which vocabulary was most suitable for the audio content, although it could not guarantee the validity of the content. It is conduct with previous research which states that visual aids can help hearing impairment to extract speech-relevant information from visual images. ⁴⁹ Not to mention, RA's limited hearing also depends on several situations. An example is the noise level. A learning environment that is too crowded will make it difficult for RA to digest the speaker's speech. Audio that is too fast also makes RA difficult to understand the vocabulary used. Thus, one aspect overlaps with another; it was providing obstacles for RA to maximize her listening skills amidst the hearing loss she got.

FN stated, "... At that time I was given the opportunity to communicate with a speaker. ..."

RA stated, "The point is I like challenges. So, for me, learning a new language is a venture worth trying ..."

⁴⁸ Hendriks, B., van Meurs, F., & Reimer, A.-K. The evaluation of lecturers' nonnative-accented English: Dutch and German students' evaluations of different degrees of Dutch-accented and German-accented English of lecturers in higher education. *Journal of English for Academic Purposes*, *34*, 2018, 28–45. doi:10.1016/j.jeap.2018.03.001

⁴⁹ Rebecca Holt, Laurence Bruggeman, Katherine Demuth. Effects of hearing loss and audio-visual cues on children's speech processing speed. Speech Communication. Volume 146. 2023. 11-21. ISSN 0167-6393. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.specom.2022.11.003.

Even though RA and FN admit how difficult listening was for the deaf, listening still brings impressive experience for both of them. As with FN's experience, she was very happy because she was allowed to discuss with native speakers directly in front of students and lecturers. The listening process that she got directly from a native made her feel very valued by the people around her. Meanwhile, RA, who has mostly conducted online lectures since semester 3, felt that listening was a challenge that must be faced. Her limitations did not stop her enthusiasm for learning English, which she had started in Islamic junior high school. Moreover, learning listening on campus also prioritizes skill development and is supported by extensive material enrichment. In the end, this provision really helped RA, including in developing her business. It is similar to various previous studies indicating the influence of promotion using English as global access.⁵⁰

FN stated, "The regular campus does not have facilities and infrastructure to support disabilities ..."

RA stated, "... So, during the pandemic, the use of electronic media seemed to be an important component in the daily learning process. ..."

For the larger context, higher educational demands should be supported by improved facilities and infrastructure. Because, admittedly or not, the educational institutions in general is rarely pay attention to the importance of facilities and infrastructure for students with disabilities. Students with disabilities are indeed able to adjust to the lecture environment both personally and interpersonally. ⁵¹ Educational facilities are only provided in general for most normal students without considering the special facilities needed by persons with disabilities in lectures. RA and FN acknowledged this, although neither of them complained too much about this condition. This is why FN and RA think that there are many other alternatives to balance themselves in lectures without depending on certain facilities provided by the campus. It is just that the provision of disability support facilities

52

⁵⁰ Nickerson, C., Gerritsen, M., & Meurs, F. van. Raising student awareness of the use of English for specific business purposes in the European context: A staff–student project. *English for Specific Purposes*, 24(3), 2005, 333–345. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.esp.2005.01.003

⁵¹ Getzel, E. E., & Thoma, C. A. Experiences of College Students With Disabilities and the Importance of Self-Determination in Higher Education Settings. *Career Development for Exceptional Individuals*, 31(2), 2008, 77–84. https://doi.org/10.1177/0885728808317658

will be very useful for students with special needs to maximize their potential.

RA stated, "... <u>Various types of educational media like that are</u> quite helpful for me to understand which way is most effective for me to understand the subject matter is simply a way to minimize obstacles...."

In the end, each of the participants has a different method of dealing with challenges in listening class. Just as RA always empowers its gadgets for virtual learning, RA believes that learning media available online can become an important component in the process of assisting everyday learning. Moreover, some online learning media also consider it to bring some conveniences for her. Such as flexible learning so that she can choose a comfortable and conducive place to study or the advantages of online media such as YouTube or audio that can be played repeatedly when something is not clear. She also could access the visuals shared by the lecturer while teaching. It is different from offline lectures which tend to be heard only once when a lecturer or friend is giving a presentation. Indirectly, online learning does provide many advantages for students while being able to empower them properly.⁵²

FN stated, "... one way for me to balance myself in lectures is to use the speech-to-text feature. ..."

Likewise, FN uses its gadget to facilitate offline learning. It is namely using the speech-to-text feature while the lecturer explains the material in class. FN chose to use the speech-to-text feature which can be accessed from software and applications to optimize listening to material delivered by lecturers during learning. Of course, the results of the automatic transcription by this feature can be reviewed again when something was not heard clearly. Moreover, FN admitted that she preferred to sit in the corner with her friends rather than sit in the front.

Talking about utilizing the speech-to-text feature, this feature is feature that helps users' process speech into writing. This feature can capture sound at a moderate tempo to be applied to writing and can make corrections orally.⁵³ To information from FN, blind people to

⁵² Appanna, S. A Review of Benefits and Limitations of Online Learning in the Context of the Student, the Instructor and the Tenured Faculty. *International Journal on E-Learning*, 2008, 7.

⁵³ Kambouri, M., Simon, H., & Brooks, G. Using speech-to-text technology to empower young writers with special educational needs. *Research in Developmental Disabilities*, 2023, *135*. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ridd.2023.104466

reply to messages in written form even though they do not have good eyesight to type messages generally use this feature. It is the same with the utilization of the talk back feature which is used by the blind to read texts on cell phones into spoken form.⁵⁴ The existence of these features blurs the gap between normal and blind people in virtual communication. So, even the blind can still use gadgets in everyday life.

In addition, speech-to-text features like this are also widely used for work purposes. Like writer who do not have enough time to type, they will take advantage of this feature to record their speech in written form while they are doing other activities. In fact, some writers think that using this feature makes writing scripts faster without making their hands go numb. It is just that the sound capture accuracy of this feature is also not optimal, so it requires re-correction. It is same as FN's opinion regarding the lack of this feature. So, however, lecture activities cannot be maximized just by using this feature, but also require perseverance in listening to learning. Moreover, the complexity of learning in the classroom also changes. It can be rowdy, it can be quiet. It can be loud, it can be slow. Meanwhile, the cellphone's voice capture sensor is also less sharp, especially for old type phone, which increases the possibility of many defects in the captured text results.

FN stated, "... <u>Make lots of friends, discuss with friends, and join organizations.</u> That's me. ..."

Nevertheless, FN admitted that the use of this feature was not carried out continuously because of the limited distance and room conditions which also affected the accuracy of the transcription. So, FN realized that the best effort to compensate for the difficulty of the listening class was to empower oneself as much as possible. However, if her listening ability is deemed not optimal, FN will carry out the following settlements:

FN stated, "... my friend is willing to repeat the lecturer's explanation, explaining it to me until I understand."

Ask or discuss with friends about the context of the audio; it was said that FN's friends volunteered to help her as if they were willing to re-explain the material that had been presented by the lecturer. Additionally, FN also often discussed with her friends about the context

⁵⁴ André Rodrigues, Kyle Montague, Hugo Nicolau, & Tiago Guerreiro. Getting Smartphones to Talkback: Understanding the Smartphone Adoption Process of Blind Users. ASSETS 2015 - 17th International ACM SIGACCESS Conference on Computers and Accessibility. 2015. DOI:10.1145/2700648.2809842

⁵⁵ Group in Facebook observation, 24th April 2023

of the audio. If they did not find the main information or find differences of opinion, FN was forced to carry out the second stage of settlement.

FN stated, "... the lecturer helped me personally by giving me the transcript. ..."

Contact the lecturer to ask for an explanation; FN's situation as a deaf person and her attitude which tends to be open-minded with both lecturers and students made it easier for FN to attract the lecturer's sympathy. Namely, lecturers who understand the state of FN on average will be willing to provide a transcript of the audio or at least provide basic information about the audio content. This assistance is very valuable for FN because FN can understand audio more quickly.

FN stated, "... So if I'm really stuck, I have to get close to the lecturer. Close to lecturers, in the sense that some of my lecturers are really close to me ..."

Consult with the closest lecturer; it is just that the second stage was not always smooth sailing for FN. There were times when some lecturers tend to lack understanding, so FN has to find another way to solve the problem. It is namely connecting lecturers who were close to her to ask for advice on the problems at hand. Sometimes, the lecturer was even willing to assist, such as helping to give understanding to the lecturer concerned so that he can better understand the condition of FN.

FN stated, "... Even when I passed them on the street or in the lecturer's room, to ask. ..."

Meet the lecturer directly; the last step FN chose when sending a message did not have a significant impact was to meet the lecturer directly. FN held these meetings when they met lecturers or made appointments in the lecturer's room to discuss more deeply about assignments or material that was difficult to understand. Then, in general, the lecturers will find it easier to understand FN's situation as well as sympathize. It was just that these efforts would not be carried out if she did not have friends who were willing to accompany her to meet the lecturer. However, assistance and support for persons with disabilities do have a positive impact, although it does not fully exclude them; it is also a wise step to stimulate their development and independence. ⁵⁶

-

⁵⁶ Drăghici, E. *The Importance of Day Care Centers in the Life of the Disabled People and Their Families*. 2022. 137–151.

RA stated, "... <u>Especially the way we review some of the</u> material at the end of class. ..."

In contrast to RAs who try to take listening classes based on listening skills, she already has. RA's efforts were maximized by finding seats around students who were not too rowdy. For RA, the best way to optimize listening skills is to always focus while listening. This is the most basic technique that RA uses to communicate with her friends so most of her friends were not aware of RA's true condition. In fact, some others hardly believe that she was deaf due to her high ability to focus. For RA, the success or failure of the education she takes depends on the effort she puts into it. That is why, even when conducting virtual learning during a pandemic, RAs tend to be diligent in reviewing the material herself if something was still not understood, including listening material.

FN stated, "... elllo.org.id or if you search on the AppStore ..."

As for the development process, RA and FN recommend several applications that can help improve listening skills. As recommended by FN, an application called elllo and a website called elllo.or.id is an application that focuses on developing listening skills. Elllo itself stands for English Listening Lesson Library Online, which was initiated by Todd Beucken from Japan.⁵⁷ The development of the application does not only contain audio or video accompanied by transcripts. In fact, several additional features can be accessed, including English grammatical knowledge, listening tips, games, exercises, and worksheets.⁵⁸ The use of this application brings many benefits such as free access to audio, and providing various levels of difficulty for students, so that they can get authentic material.⁵⁹

RA stated, "... oh if someone say this in a native speaker, it will be like that, right? ..."

⁵⁷ Palangngan, S. T., Atmowardoyo, H., & Weda, S. (2016). English Listening Lesson Library Online (ELLLO) as a Supporting Media in Learning Listening. *ELT Worldwide: Journal of English Language Teaching*, 3(1), 51. https://doi.org/10.26858/eltww.v3i1.1880

⁵⁸ Milliner, B., & Chaikul, R. (n.d.). Extensive Listening in the ELF Classroom with ELLLO ELF プログラムにおける多聴の試み: ELLLO を用いたリスニング研究. http://accent.gmu.edu/

⁵⁹ Al Ikhsan, M. S. *Students' Perception on the Use of Elllo in Listening Class*. 2021. 36.

Meanwhile, for RA herself, RA can improve her listening skills by watching English movies with English subtitles too. Because the characteristics of speaking English between Indonesians and native speakers are often different even when talking in English. Either looking for delivery or pronunciation acquired in the film can be used to improve students' phonological abilities. Therefore, using English subtitles (instead of Indonesian) will be able to enrich vocabulary knowledge in the context of the naturalization of native speakers. Where the acquisition will have an impact such as would have better English vocabulary, grammar, and listening comprehension. 60

RA stated, "... we use the English transcript feature on YouTube or foreign films like that ..."

Apart from that, RA also recommends YouTube complete with subtitles to enrich vocabulary to get shorter video durations. Remember that vocabulary is an important aspect that can increase new ideas and experiences. ⁶¹ This includes stimulating one's understanding when listening to audio or video in English.

There are differences in perception between RA and FN. Namely, RA tends to develop listening skills by watching lots of English films with English subtitles as well as to improve vocabulary and pronunciation skills. This meant that if she was used to hearing English spoken with the correct pronunciation, it would be easier for RA to understand the difference in similar pronunciation in listening which has a different vocabulary. In addition, for simplicity, RA is also used to watching YouTube using subtitles. The subtitle function on YouTube is also similar to watching English films with subtitles and can even reach the end of the video with a shorter duration. From this refraction, RA becomes accustomed to listening to overlapping articulations so that she can understand the difference in the pronunciation of one word with another similar word.

FN stated, "... If we pay close attention, many subtitles don't match with the speakers are saying. ..."

Meanwhile, FN tends to disagree with the use of YouTube subtitles in vocabulary or pronunciation enrichment. This is because the

⁶⁰ Rupérez Micola, A., Aparicio Fenoll, A., Banal-Estañol, A., & Bris, A. TV or not TV? The impact of subtitling on English skills. *Journal of Economic Behavior and Organization*, 2019, *158*, 487–499. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jebo.2018.12.019

⁶¹ Mousavi, F., & Gholami, J. Effects of Watching Flash Stories with or without Subtitle and Reading Subtitles on Incidental Vocabulary Acquisition. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 98, 2014, 1273–1281. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2014.03.543

YouTube subtitles made automatically generated by the machine often experience incompatibility with the actual audio content. If the audience only relies on YouTube subtitles, the audience will likely misunderstand the video content. As FN believes, YouTube subtitles are sometimes inaccurate in some videos. Especially if the English voice actor did not come from a native speaker directly. Perhaps, the accent of the voice actor cannot be machine-read accurately so some of the words in the subtitles are wrong. Moreover, not all videos on YouTube can provide subtitles automatically.

FN's opinion has motivated researcher to observe several examples of popular videos from native speakers circulating on YouTube. Especially videos about news from TV channels, vlog videos from native, as well as popular music in English. Based on observations from some of these videos, the use of English spoken by native speakers can directly produce English subtitles that are quite accurate. It is just that researcher found a generational error in music videos that have a rather complex accent. It is namely the music video for Alan Walker feat. Emma Steinbakken entitled "Not You".

If we listen carefully to the audio, Emma's singing style occasionally cuts off notes at the end of notes like the lyrics; "... he will never be -- you ..." After saying the word 'be', Emma made a broken tone before moving on to the word 'you'. Of course, her singing creations are unique as well as beautiful. It is just that the generated YouTube transcript could not capture the word 'you' properly so the only transcript that was obtained was 'he will never be' without the affix 'you'. This applies to several other lyrics whose generations were also lost due to the influence of music which was more dominant than the lyrics being sung so that some subtitles only appeared with the description 'music' or 'is'.

The same lyrics also gave different automatic transcripts. This time, the word 'you' was successfully generated by YouTube. However, the problem changed to the generation of 'be' which was said with a broken accent. Instead of succeeding in making the subtitle "he will never be you", YouTube has instead made the subtitle "he will never beat you". So the broken tone that is said in the vocabulary 'be' makes the machine read distracted to 'beat'. In fact, the change from 'be' to 'beat' certainly carries a meaning and understanding that is very far from the actual context. In fact, on the live ghost music video in Tampa, YouTube was also able to provide accurate subtitles despite the noise and some talking outside of the song lyrics.

In addition, the researcher tried to find several YouTube videos in English where the source was not a native speaker. It is just that, they

still use English as a second language like India and Malaysia so that the use of English is still quite dominant. In essence, the researcher wants to see the results of generating subtitles that have a dialectical influence on the use of English. What's more, of course, the use of that language is also occasionally combined with their native language, namely Tamil and Malay.

If you observe the results of automatic subtitles from news circulating in English, generally viewers can generate transcripts that match the audio content. However, this is reasonable because the selection of sources and reporters in the news is of course based on good English skills as well. It is different when researchers observe movie trailers spread on YouTube. If the trailer mixes English with the mother tongue, there will be many mistakes in the generation results. In fact, some talks cannot YouTube generated automatically, either because of the distraction from the audio video background or because of the confusion of the language that shifts from English to mother tongue. So it can be concluded that FN's anxiety is quite reasonable because after all machines do have limitations in 'thinking' and processing information.

FN stated, "... elllo, the transcript matches the audio. So, the validity of context and content must be guaranteed. ..."

That is why FN is more amenable to using the elllo web or application to improve listening skills. Native speaker recommended this application during a special talk session with her. This application itself is quite helpful in improving listening skills because each audio or video has the right transcript. In addition, the voice actors also vary from various countries, including countries in Asia. That way, listeners will be more used to distinguishing vocabulary based on the accent of each country. Moreover, several studies about ELLLO have also shown a significant increase in comprehensive listening skills for the majority of students. 63

However, in the end, choosing to use elllo or YouTube as a medium for developing listening skills still depends on individual decisions. This is because each application has its advantages and disadvantages. Even though YouTube subtitles are sometimes inaccurate, the content circulating on YouTube is also very diverse so

⁶² YouTube observation. 1st June 2023. 'Not You' & 'Mary on Across' song.

⁶³ Soleha, A. S. The Influence of Using Elllo Application toward Students' Listening Skill at the Second Semester of Eleventh-Grade of Man 1 Bandar Lampung in Academic. 2022.

viewers can adjust any content that really fits their interests. The variety of content available will really broaden horizons while enriching the vocabulary of the audience. It is because YouTube is offer for users new, innovative, and extraordinary material and teaching options. ⁶⁴ It is just that the audience should be aware of the subtitles that appear to detect any mistakes in the script. After all, at least this feature is very flexible and can help in learning. Especially for students who access YouTube a lot as a learning medium. Therefore, it is normal if the automatic generating machine experiences a system error. It is the same as an automatic summarization transcription machine that cannot generate results as well as humans. ⁶⁵

Meanwhile, the audio provided by the elllo website or application is pre-planned audio. This means that the content provided by the application is limited to content that has educational purposes. Thus, the issues discussed in the application are also limited. In fact, the duration provided is also relatively short. That is only about one to four minutes. So the convenience factor is largely determined by the individual, whether they want to choose elllo, whose transcripts are accurate although limited or use YouTube so they can choose content based on their interests even should take more awareness with subtitles.

RA stated, "... <u>if you want to communicate on a global scale, you need English.</u> <u>English is like a bridge.</u> ..."

FN stated, "... <u>In addition to improving skills and abilities, students also need this to take the TOEFL and IELTS exams</u> ..."

Apart from the complex listening learning process for the deaf, English listening skills still bring benefits. Namely, listening can be a bridge that connects communication with foreign parties and it is useful for updating academic fields such as when taking the TOEFL and IELTS tests. In the end, Deafness or hard of hearing (DHH) who still can hear can still learn English. Even she learned to listen to English. Even if the accuracy they got is not as good as normal people who study at the same level.

60

⁶⁴ Kumar Roy, Sanjoy. Youtube's Influential Factors for Academic Achievement: A Two-Stage Approach. *Telematics and Informatics Reports*, 2023, 11. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.teler.2023.100060

⁶⁵ Albeer, R. A., AL-Shahad, H. F., Aleqabie, H. J., & Al-shakarchy, N. D. Automatic summarization of YouTube video transcription text using term frequency-inverse document frequency. *Indonesian Journal of Electrical Engineering and Computer Science*, 26(3), 2022, 1512. https://doi.org/10.11591/ijeecs.v26.i3.pp1512-1519

RA stated, "... <u>Always be a good person who doesn't</u> discriminate against people's shortcomings or circumstances ..."

FN stated, "... We have to work harder and study harder so we can keep up with others and not inconvenience others. ..."

Finally, RA hopes that fellow human beings are willing to understand each other's shortcomings and not discriminate against other people's shortcomings. The deaf also does not need to feel inferior. Moreover, in this modern era, there are many technologies and medical treatments that can help overcome hearing loss. Meanwhile, FN advised deaf people to study hard so they can adapt to the learning environment. FN also suggested not being too reluctant in asking friends or lecturers for help when you have difficulties.