

REFERENCES

- Abid, Nus Khan. Qualitative Meta-Analysis Study of Learning and Learning English in Islamic Boarding Schools. *Kajian Qualitative Meta-Analysis Belajar dan Pembelajaran Bahasa Inggris di Pesantren*. (State Islamic Institute of Kudus. Indonesia. Vol. 5 No. 1. 2022).
- Amilia, Intan Kris, et al. The Effectiveness of Send A Problem Technique for Teaching Writing An Analytical Exposition Text. (English Department. Faculty of Languages and Arts. State University of Semarang. Indonesia. 2016).
- Ariyanti. The Teaching of EFL Writing in Indonesia. (Widyagama Mahakam University Samarinda. East Kalimantan. Indonesia. 2016).
- Aruan, Rumiri. A Survey on The Teaching of Writing at Senior High Schools in Riau Province. (Riau University, Indonesia. 2018).
- Arvianto, Faizal. Contribution of Writing Interest Toward Indonesian Language Learning of Students in Vocation High Schools. (Timor University. Indonesia. 2021).
- Costa, Romina B. da. Stephani M. Hall. Anne Spear. Whose Reality? Meta-Analysis of Qualitative Research in International and Comparative Education. (University of Maryland, Collage Park. Maryland. USA. 2016).
- Cheung, Yin Ling. Teaching Writing. (Nanyang Technological University). New York. NY: Spinger International. 2016).
- Diana, Lia. Improving Students' Skill in Writing Short Paragraph by Using Simple Present Tense at Frist Semester. (University of Pahlawan Tuanku Tambusai. Riau. Indonesia. 2019)
- Efrianto. The Effectiveness of the Modeling Method in Learning Writing Poetry Skills. (State University of Jakarta. Indonesia. 2022)
- Emzir. Genre Based Writing Indonesian: Teacher's Role in Teaching Writing in Senior High School of Banten, Indonesia. (State University Of Jakarta. Indonesia. 2020)
- Fatimah. Harits Masduqi. Research Trends in EFL Writing in Indonesia, Where Art Thou?. (Journal of Teaching and Education. The Univesity of Sydney. Brawijaya University of Malang. 2017).

- Feliks, Tans, Agustinus Semiun, Hilda M. Nalley. *The Teaching and Learning Writing in Indonesia: a Case Study of a Primary School*. (Nusa Cendana University, Kupang, Indonesia. 2019).
- Frankel, Katherine K., PhD, Maneka Deanna Brooks, PhD, at all. *A Meta-Synthesis of Qualitative Research on Reading Intervention Classes in Secondary Schools*. (Teachers Collage Record: The Voice of Scholarship in Education. Columbia University. 2021).
- Graham, Steve. Michael Hebert. Karen R. Harris. *Formative Assessment and Writing: A Meta-Analysis*. (The Pillars of Diversity and Inclusion. University of Chicago Press).
- Hanifah, Zakiyah. *Teaching Senior High School Students to Write Personal Letters by Using Google Classroom*. (University of Padang, Indonesia. 2019)
- Handoko. *Instructional Design for Teaching Writing at Department English Education*. (School of Teacher Training and Education Muhammadiyah University of Surakarta. Indonesia. 2014).
- Hammarbeg, K.. M. Kirkman. S. de Lacey. *Qualitative Research Methods: When to Use Them and How to Judge Them*. (Oxford Academic. Human Reproduction. Vol 31. Issue 3. England. 2016).
- Haris, Hasan. *The Use of Documentary Video to Teach Writing News Item Text to The Tenth Grade Students in SMAN 4 Bangkalan*. (English Education. Faculty of Language and Arts. State University of Surabaya. 2013).
- Hartono. *Senior High School Teachers' Assessment on Students' Writing skill*. (State University of Malang. Indonesia. 2013)
- Hasanah, Nurbaiti. *Meta-Analysis*. (Semarang State University. Semarang. Indonesia. 2016).
- Ilhami, Nurjanuar. *The Use of Webbing Technique in Writing Spoof Text to The Class XI IPS at SMA Muhammadiyah 1*
- Indriyani, Rahma Dian. *Using Writing Diary to Improve Students' Writing Ability on Recount Text*. (State Islamic University Syarif Hidayatullah. Jakarta. Indonesia. 2020)
- Ismail, Syofianis. M. Zaim. Nurhizrah Gistituanti. *Teaching Writing by Using Social Media for High School Students in Indonesia*. (Islamic University of Riau. State University of Padang. Indonesia. 2018).

- Kartika, et al. The Meta Analysis: Research Variations of Undergraduate Financial Management Students in Indonesia. (BinaInsan University. Adpebi International Conference on Management Education, Social, Economics and Technology. Indonesia. 2022).
- Kencana, Caries Tirta, Nur Fauzia. The Use Instagram to Improve Students' Writing Skills in Explanation Text for Eleventh Grade Students. (Surabaya State University. Indonesia. 2022).
- Lachman, Sheldon J. Learning is a Process: Toward an Improved Definition of Learning. (The Journal of Psychology, Volume 131. 2010).
- Leung, Lawrence. Validity, Reliability, and Generalizability in Qualitative Research. (Queen's University. Kingston. Ontario. Canada. 2015).
- Lokman, Hairul Faiezi Bin. Ruhizan Mohammad Yasin. Fariza Khalid. Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis on The Effectiveness of Facebook Application in Teaching and Learning Process. (International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences. Vol 7. No 5. National University of Malaysia. 2017).
- Loo, Daron Benjamin. A Qualitative Meta-Synthesis of Studies on Learner Reflections: Lessons for English Language Learner Reflection. (Centre for English Language Communication, National University of Singapore. Singapore. 2019).
- Lorenc, Theo. Lambert Felix et al. Meta-Analysis, Complexity and Heterogeneity: A Qualitative Interview Study of Researchers' Methodological Values and Practices. (Bio Med Central Ltd. Springer Nature. California. 2016).
- Lukman, et al. Guide Editorial Scientific Journal Management. (Ministry of Research Technology/National Research and Innovation Agency. Indonesia. 2020).
- Maliyatika, Ulya, et al. The Use of Cue Cards for Teaching Writing of Biography Text. (Prominent Journal. Muria Kudus University. Indonesia. 2018).
- Meglino, Bruce. What Type of Research is Meta-Analysis. (Ph. D in Organization Psychology and Social Psychology. University of Massachusetts, Amherst. Southeastern. US).
- Moeller, Kim. Qualitative Meta-Synthesis. (Malmo University. Digitala Vetenskapliga Arkivet. 2021).

- Moral, Reynaldo V.. Don Sergio Osmena. *Passion and Commitment I Teaching Research: A Meta-Synthesis*. (Qubahan Academic Journal.Cebu City. Philipines. 2021).
- Mudjiman, Agustinus. *Objective Empirical Research in Writing Papers*.(Pakuan University. Bogor. Indonesia. 2020).
- Muna, AfzalSayed, Md Abdul Kalam. *Teaching and Learning Process to Enhance Teaching Effectiveness: a Literature Review*. (School of Business, University of Wales Trinity Saint David. London. 2021)
- Muthoharoh, Nadia Raudhotul, Anita. *Using Feedback in Teaching Writing Descriptive Text*. (State Islamic University of Sultan Maulana Hasanuddin Banten. Indonesia. 2018).
- Nicolas, Alvin. *How to Best use References in a Dissertation*. (Research Prospect. 2021).
- Nugroho, BimoAdi. *Observational Study on the Teacher's Method and Assessment in Teaching Writing Skill in a Senior High School in Jember*. (University of Jember. Indonesia. 2019)
- Nurani, Atika Ayu. Tiyas Saputri. *The Influence of Using Mind Mapping Technique to Improve Writing Skill in Descriptive Text at Junior High School (Meta-Analysis)*. (Nahdlatul Ulama University of Surabaya. Indonesia. 2020).
- Page, Matthew J. et al. *The Prisma 2020 Statement: An Updated Guideline for Reporting Systematic Reviews*. (National Library of Medicine. USA. 2021).
- Page et al. *The PRISMA 2020 Statement: An Update Guideline for Reporting Systematic Reviews*.
- Pamekasan. (English Teacher.SMA Muhammadiyah 1 Pamekasan. Indonesia. 2018).
- Peterson B.L, et al. *Meta Study of Qualitative Health Research: Practical Guide to Meta-analysis and Meta-synthesis*. (Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.2001).
- Pigott, Terry D.. Joshua R. Polanin. *Methodological Guidance Paper: High-Quality Meta-Analysis in a Systematic Review*. (Loyola University Chicago. American Institutes for Research. 2020).
- Purwanto, Muhamad Bambang, Boy Sandi. *Teaching Writing Recount Text by Using Mind Mapping*. (Language and Education Journal. Indonesia. 2022). Accessed Dec. 01, 2023.

- Purwoko, HeruEka, et al. The Use of English Movie to Teach Writing Narrative Text to The Tenth Grade Students at SMK PGRI 2 Sidoarjo. (Sidoarjo Teacher Training and Education College. Indonesia. 2018).
- Rachman, Rizqina, et al. The Effectiveness of Numbered Heads Together Technique in Teaching Writing Hortatory Exposition Text. (University of Muhammadiyah Surabaya. Indonesia. 2017).
- Rahmati, Jafar. A Meta-analysis on Educational Technology in English Language Teaching.(Language Testing in Asia. 2021).
- Rachmaida, Fahria, Mutiarani. The Use of Spinning Wheel Games to Improve Students' Writing Procedural Texts .(English Language Education.Faculty Science Education.Muhammdiyah University. Jakarta. Indonesia. 2022).
- Rachmawati, Diana. The Teaching of Writing in English Education Study Program. (State Islamic Institute of Palangka Raya. Indonesia. 2020).
- Rosang, Dita Amelia. The Integration of Facebook to Make Teaching and Learning Writing Skill in EFL More Entertaining. (Ganesha University of Education.Bali. Indonesia. 2021).
- Roxas, Mark Joshua D.. Exploring Senior High School Students' Academic Writing Difficulties: Towards an Academic Writing Model. (University of Perpetual Help – Molino. Cavite. Philippines. 2020).
- Selvam, Dinesh. Meta Analysis-Qualitative. (Ultimate Library with Scribd. 2013).
- Sertoglu, Gulsum. Methods and Techniques in Writing Education: A Meta-Syntesis Study. (T.C. Mehmet Akif Ersoy Universitesi Egitim Fakultesi .Vol 6.Issue 2. Turkey. 2020).
- Shuttleworth, Martyn, Lyndsay T Wilson. (Meta-Analysis). European Union's Horizon Research and Motivation Programme. 2020).
- Siswanto. Systematic Review Sebagai Metode Penelitian untuk Mensintesis Hasil-Hasil Penelitian. Systematic Review as A Research Method for Synthesis of Research Result. (Health System Research Bulletin.Vol. 13.No.4. Indonesia. 2010).

- Taufikurohman, Ilham Sukma. The Effectiveness of Using Padlet in Teaching Writing Descriptive Text. (English Education Program. Faculty of Teacher Training and Education. Galuh University. Indonesia. 2018).
- Tawfik, Gehad Mohamed. Nguyen Tien Huy et al. A Step by Step Guide for Conducting a Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis with Simulation Data. (Trop Med Health 47,46. 2019).
- Timulak, Ladislav. Meta-analysis of Qualitative Studies: a Tool for Reviewing Qualitative Research Findings in Psychotherapy. (National Center for Biotechnology Information. United States. 2009).
- Tranfiel D, et al. Towards A Methodology for Developing Evidence-Informed Management Knowledge by Means of Systematics Review Introduction: The Need for An Evidence-Informed Approach. (British Journals of Management. 2019).
- Truckenmiller, J., Expanding Assessment to Instructionally Relevant Writing Components in Middle School. (Journal of School Psychology. Vol 94. 2022).
- Utomo, Tri Widodo W.. Meta Analisis Dalam Studi Kebijakan (Pendekatan Kualitatif). Meta-Analysis in Policy Studies (Qualitative Approach). (Access the Ultimate Library with Scribd. Indonesia. 2016).
- Wang, Hung-Chun. "Teaching is Learning": Creating a Meaningful English L2 Writing Class with Service-Learning. (Pedagogies: An International Journal, Volume 14. 2019).
- Wely, Madelon Van. The Good, The Bad and The Ugly: Meta-Analyses. (Human Reproduction, Volume 29, Issue 8, Pages 1622-1626. Oxford Academic. England. 2014).
- Wen, Xue. Shauna M. Walters. The Impact of Technology on Students' Writing Performances in Elementary Classrooms: A Meta-Analysis. (Department of Educational Research. Louisiana State University. Baton Rouge. Louisiana. USA. 2022).
- Widhiastuti, Hardani. Meta-Analysis Study of Relationship Between Work Stress with Work Achievement. (Psychology Journal, Semarang University. 2002).

- Wilson, Suzzane M., Penelope L. Peterson. Theories of Learning and Teaching What Do They Mean for Educators?. (Washington DC:NEA. 2006).
- Xiaoxuan Lv. et al. The Effects of Online Feedback on ESL/EFL Writing : A Meta-Analysis. (National Library of Medicine.Spinger Nature. 2021).
- Yahya, Sahlan, et al. The Analysis of Descriptive Statistic on The Use of Syariah Fintech in Indonesia. (Journal of Theory and Applied Sharia Economics. Airlangga University. 2020).
- Zimmer, Lela. Qualitative Meta-Analysis: a Question of Dialoguing with Texts. (National Library of Medicine. 2006).

