

Contestation of Islamic educational institutions in Indonesia: Content analysis on social media

by Maemonah H Zuhri, M Masturin, A Syafii, H Aziz

Submission date: 20-Mar-2023 09:05AM (UTC+0700)

Submission ID: 2041128280

File name: Jurnal_Internasional_Masturin_2.pdf (3.73M)

Word count: 8797

Character count: 51539



1 Contestation of Islamic educational institutions in Indonesia: Content analysis on social media

Maemonah Maemonah, H. Zuhri, Masturin Masturin, Ahmad Syafii & Hafidh Aziz

To cite this article: Maemonah Maemonah, H. Zuhri, Masturin Masturin, Ahmad Syafii & Hafidh Aziz (2023) Contestation of Islamic educational institutions in Indonesia: Content analysis on social media, Cogent Education, 10:1, 2164019, DOI: [10.1080/2331186X.2022.2164019](https://doi.org/10.1080/2331186X.2022.2164019)

To link to this article: <https://doi.org/10.1080/2331186X.2022.2164019>



© 2023 The Author(s). This open access article is distributed under a Creative Commons Attribution (CC-BY) 4.0 license.



Published online: 05 Jan 2023.



Submit your article to this journal [↗](#)



Article views: 708



View related articles [↗](#)



View Crossmark data [↗](#)



INTERNATIONAL & COMPARATIVE EDUCATION | RESEARCH ARTICLE

Contestation of Islamic educational institutions in Indonesia: Content analysis on social media

Maemonah Maemonah^{1*}, H. Zuhri², Masturin Masturin³, Ahmad Syafii⁶ and Hafidh Aziz^{4,5}

Received: 29 August 2022
Accepted: 28 December 2022

*Corresponding author: Maemonah Maemonah, Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta, Indonesia
E-mail: maimunah@uin-suka.ac.id

Reviewing editor: Anatoly Aleksiyenko, Southeast Asia Islamic Education Study Center, Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta, Indonesia

Additional information is available at the end of the article

Abstract: Religious-based schools carry out movements by utilizing social media as a new public sphere to disseminate their Islamic identity. This study examines the contestation between three religious-based schools in Indonesia based on digital content on the school web and social media activity. The study analyzes social media accounts of Sekolah Dasar Nahdlatul Ulama (SDNU) Yogyakarta, Sekolah Dasar (SD) Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta, and Sekolah Dasar Islam Terpadu (SDIT) Taruna Al-Quran Yogyakarta. Content analysis is used for the study to find a contestation in represented of Islam. The three Islamic educational institutions compete to reveal the meaning of Islam according to each Islamic school's ideological affiliation manifested in the educational concepts, content, activity, and identity. The implication of this contestation is good competition to raise ideological



Maemonah Maemonah

ABOUT THE AUTHORS

Maemonah Maemonah is an associate professor of the study program of Education for Islamic Elementary School Teachers at the State Islamic University Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta, Indonesia. Her concerns as editor and reviewer are in Islamic Education and Philosophy Education's scope. Please direct correspondence to maimunah@uin-suka.ac.id

H. Zuhri is an associate professor of the Aqidah and Islamic Philosophy study program at the State Islamic University Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta, Indonesia. His concerns are in Islamic Philosophy, Islamic Studies, and Religious Studies. Please direct correspondence to zuhri@uin-suka.ac.id

Masturin Masturin is an associate professor of the study program of Islamic Education at the Tarbiyah Faculty, Institut Agama Islam Negeri Kudus Indonesia. His concerns are in the scope of Management of Islamic Education. Please direct correspondence to masturin@iainkudus.ac.id

Ahmad Syafii is a researcher at Southeast Asia Islamic Education Study Center at the State Islamic University Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta, Indonesia. His concerns as editor and reviewer are in management information Systems, Bigdata, and Data Analysis. Please direct correspondence to azfy99@gmail.com

Hafidh Aziz is an assistant professor of the study program of Islamic Early Childhood Education at the State Islamic University Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta, Indonesia. His concerns as editor and reviewer are in the scope of early childhood education, Islamic Studies, and Islamic Education. Please direct correspondence to hafidh.aziz@uin-suka.ac.id

PUBLIC INTEREST STATEMENT

Islamic education in Indonesia cannot be separated from its relationship with developing the latest communication media. In addition, various non-state sector religious organizations strongly influence Islamic education development in Indonesia. In practice, these Islamic religious organizations have contested Islam's face through their educational institutions. As a new public space, social media has become a place for Islamic Educational Institutions in Indonesia to show their Islamic identity according to their respective characteristics. This study highlights the identity contestation conducted by Islamic Educational Institutions in Indonesia on social media.

1 education on one side and group Islam based on ideological affiliation on the other. There is a need for empirical research on the impact of madrasas on the grouping and forming of the student ideology.

Subjects: Educational Research; Moral & Values Education; Theory of Education

1 **Keywords:** contestation; Islamic education institutions; content analysis; social media; Indonesia

1. Introduction

The study of ideology in Islamic education has touched on many aspects. It is because the stakeholders in Islamic education have diverse ideological backgrounds. Islamic education is still more prominent in its non-formal functions than formal achievements (Thomas, 1988). Meanwhile, Islamic education is still more inclined to the process of indoctrination (Das et al., 2018; Tan, 2011) than its transfer of knowledge role (Ikhwan et al., 2020). It happens because there is still a gap 6 and a paradigmatic difference between the philosophy of modern education on the one hand and the philosophy of Islamic education on the other (Cook, 1999; Fahmi & Rohman, 2021; Halstead, 2004).

Islamic education is still bound by and for itself. It can be concluded that Islamic education still focuses on ideological discourse rather than efforts to humanize humans (Maemonah, 2015). Islamic educational institutions are bound to the Islamic identity of the Islamic organization that houses them. For this reason, it is necessary to re-evaluate the paradigm and worldview inherent in Islamic education in Indonesia so that Islamic education can be forward-oriented, although it does not have to abandon its old traditions.

In Indonesia, Islamic education is a religious teaching process (Bashori et al., 2020) such as *Pesantren* (traditional Islamic Boarding School in Java), *muansah*, and *surau* (traditional Islamic Boarding School in Aceh), or learning at religious education institutions (Islamic Schools) such as madrasas. Religious aspects make Islamic education prioritize *al-ta'dib wa al-tarbiyah* (authentic education; Ahmed, 2018) over the discourse of science that can hone critical reasoning (Sahin, 2018). Islamic education is any form of instruction or learning founded on Islamic principles and values (Tan, 2011). Islamic education has historically used various methods to instill its traditions, cultures, and values (Arimbi, 2009; Dressler et al., 2019). According to Hussain (2010), Muslim scholars make no distinction between the sciences and the arts. All knowledge, as *Ilm* (science), includes any attempt to comprehend, explain, control, or influence human and natural events and relationships. The only distinction in Islamic knowledge is between revealed sciences, or religious sciences, and acquired sciences.

The development of the Islamic movement does emphasize the educational aspect. Characteristics of Islamic identity appear in the learning carried out by formal school institutions. Modern school institutions shape Islamic identity among students (Azmi et al., 2020). The school environment is influential in the process of forming an Islamic self-identity. Although the formation of Islamic identity seems exclusive, the study conducted by Belonozhko et al. (2017) shows that the formation of Islamic identity also forms the socio-demographic characteristics of religious and non-religious representatives of the Islamic population are now blurred. Nowadays, it is difficult to trace a clear dependence between the level of religiosity and the age, social status, place of residence, education, condition of marriage, and income level (Belonozhko et al., 2017). The study by Suwaed and Ali (2016) confirms the occurrence of different forms (to the extent of division) in the Islamic Movement. His study describes the rivalry between the northern and southern factions of the Islamic Movement in Israel.

Even though there are similarities in the occurrence of differences (up to competition) between Islamic movements, Indonesia has different unique characteristics. A new Islamic Education

model in Indonesia is known as the Integrated Islamic School, keeping with tradition. Rather than simply teaching Islamic knowledge, the new Islamic school integrates Islamic values into daily interactions. In this sense, Islamic schools do not consider Islamic sciences core subjects in the curriculum, as do *pesantren*, madrasahs, and old Islamic schools (public schools). The new Islamic school aims to develop students' Islamic character based on religious ethics and values (H. H. Azra, 2018). The difficulty of negotiating between the traditional and modern paradigms is why Islamic education cannot escape its traditional vision (R. R. Lukens-Bull, 2019). It is also tricky to negotiate the separation of spiritual and secular values and marginalize general knowledge in religious knowledge (Aminnuddin, 2022; A. A. Azra, 2017). It was more of a doctrine than science because Islamic education generally stated that its teachings were correct without criticism and closed the dialogue path (Mul Khan, 2008).

In the modern era, Islamic education faces secularization. Islamic educational institutions are confused with the wave of secular knowledge promoted by the state or society (Tan, 2018). Secularist movements have shaped modern Islamic education in Turkey (özdalga, 2018), Russia, and India. In the 1970s, Indonesian education was proposed as national education. However, the data show that the correlation between education and religious attitudes is not entirely positive, indicating that public education does not automatically improve religious attitudes (Masuda & Yudhistira, 2020). We often hear that higher education makes one more rational in understanding religion. While education may be Islamic in character development and political vision, it is still secular in the academic context (Malik, 2014). When comparing modern (secular) knowledge theories to religious knowledge theories, the results show that modern knowledge theories have surpassed religious knowledge theories (Graaf, 2013; Thomas, 1997). Due to these strong traditions and values, Islamic education was developed based on the Qur'an, hadith (Aminnuddin & Hamid, 2021; Arifin, 2016; Mul Khan, 2008), and classical texts (R. A. R. A. Lukens-Bull, 2001). In this sense, Islamic education appears more as a doctrine than a science, as it is based on religious sources (Arifin, 2016; Fazlurrahman, 2018; Sakai & Isbah, 2014).

Islamic educational institutions in Indonesia have experienced significant development. Islamic educational institutions compete to reveal the face of Islam according to the ideological basis built. Islamic educational institutions in Indonesia also use social media as part of the adaptation process to the development of civilization. Social media has become a new public space for this Islamic educational institution to relate to the community (Dolunay et al., 2017).

Recent studies have explained various typologies of Islamic education seen from various aspects. Islamic educational institutions in Indonesia are divided into four sections based on ideological affiliation (Machali et al., 2021). The first is the ideology of compromising Islamic educational institutions. The ideology of compromise Islamic educational institutions seeks to reconcile or synthesize conflicting principles and practices. The second is the ideology of the *Aswaja*-traditionalist Islamic education institution. Institutions with traditionalist *Aswaja* ideology emphasize Islamic material based on traditional Islamic sources. The third is the ideology of modernist-reformist Islamic education institutions. Institutions with this ideology encourage the rise of Indonesian Muslims to be broad-minded, educated, modern, and responsive to changes and developments. This modernist movement views education as the most crucial program. The function of education is to eliminate illiteracy and play a role in spreading renewal ideas. Fourth is the ideology of revivalist Islamic Educational Institutions. Institutions with a revivalist ideology emphasize the return to Al-Quran and Hadith Movement. This institution aspires to return to the order of Muslim society, like the era of the Prophet Muhammad.

Jawad Ridla (2002) divides Islamic education typology into three main streams. The first is the *Al-Muhafidz* (conservative) school. This school looks at the issue of education by tending to be purely religious. The second is the flow of *al-diniy al-'aqlaniy* (religious-rational). This school recognizes that the relationship between education and religion tends to be the same as the textual traditionalist school but also uses a rational philosophical approach. The third is the *al-*

dzarai'iy (pragmatic) school. This school considers the purpose of Islamic education should be more pragmatic and oriented to the practical-applicative aspects.

The development of the concept of Islamic education also forms three tendencies, namely normative orientation, ideological orientation, and scientific orientation (Kuntowijoyo, 2018). The normative approach has two styles, declarative and apologetic. The declarative approach prioritizes da'wah orientation, while apologetics is a reactive form of orientalist who study Islam. This apologetic style tends to glorify Islam, while the ideological orientation carries the ideological basis of Islamic organizations. The scientific/scientific approach tends to adopt and respect the contributions of western scientists (Kuntowijoyo, 2018; Ztf, 2011).

The development of studies on the typology of Islamic education is experiencing challenges with new learning modes. There has been a change in the learning mode in Islamic education from offline to online (Syafii & Retnawati, 2022). These changes did not only affect aspects of learning but also broader aspects in the context of education. Internet penetration in education encourages the massive use of social media as a source of information (Islamic education; Maemonah et al., 2022). Cambell divides four layers of religious authority in the context of negotiations between religious beliefs and Internet use. The four layers are hierarchy, structures, ideology, and texts (Campbell, 2007).

On the other hand, social media has become a new space, especially for youth, to express their religion. Besides being able to be used to mobilize the masses (Hidayatullah, 2021), Social media is also a place to celebrate religious identity (Rahman et al., 2021). Social media effectively conveys religious messages related to doctrine, religious practice, and identity politics (Chakim, 2022). More openly, social media can influence ideas about authority and knowledge in Islam in the 21st century (Maemonah et al., 2022; Tsourlaki, 2020).

Previous studies are still limited to the discussion of typology based on the level of the structure of Islamic educational institutions. The discussion about the contestation between Islamic educational institutions regarding identity is displayed. Although the online learning system causes changes in religious authority (Maemonah et al., 2022), contestation between different educational institutions is still ongoing. This study describes forms of religious identity contestation among Islamic schools within the framework of Islamic education by analyzing the use of social media. This study provides a new perspective on the ideological contestation of religious education concerning social media as a new public space.

2. Methods

This qualitative content analysis research aims to analyze the data and interpret the meaning (Schreier, 2012). The content analysis in this study is intended to read, understand, and interpret the meaning of data related to the contestation of Islamic educational ideology (Cohen et al., 2017). This study emphasizes the meaningful relationship between the text, picture or video and its context (Krippendorff, 2022).

This research focuses on news, picture and all content items uploaded by social media of 3 religious-based schools in Yogyakarta, Indonesia. The three schools are *Sekolah Dasar Nahdlatul Ulama (SDNU) Yogyakarta*, *Sekolah Dasar (SD) Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta*, and *Sekolah Dasar Islam Terpadu (SDIT) Taruna Al-Quran Yogyakarta*. The three elementary schools were chosen because they have a religious and ideological affiliation (Machali et al., 2021). SDNU Yogyakarta is an elementary school affiliated with the Nahdlatul Ulama organization. Nahdlatul Ulama is the largest religious community organization in Indonesia. SDNU Yogyakarta represents the Aswaja-Traditionalist ideological affiliation. SD Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta is an elementary school affiliated with the Muhammadiyah organization. Muhammadiyah is the second-largest religious community organization in Indonesia. SD Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta represents the modernist-reformist ideological affiliation. SDIT Taruna Al-Quran is an elementary school not affiliated with

the Nahdlatul Ulama or Muhammadiyah organizations. SDIT Taruna Al-Quran Yogyakarta represents the revivalist ideological affiliation. Content analysis is appropriate because the study focuses on the meaning of qualitative data (Schreier, 2012). The study adopted a qualitative content analysis design from Mariette Bengtsson (2016).

Planning, data collection, data analysis, and reporting are the four stages of Bengtsson's design content analysis (Bengtsson, 2016). This study is intended to read, understand, and interpret the meaning of data related to the contestation of Islamic educational ideology (Cohen et al., 2017). In the planning step, the samples were the Facebook, Instagram, and YouTube accounts from SDNU Yogyakarta, SD Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta, and SDIT Taruna Al-Quran Yogyakarta. The most widely used social media for e-learning are YouTube, WhatsApp, Facebook, and Instagram (Patmanthara et al., 2019). WhatsApp is not an object of study because it is not representative of public content. This study chose social media accounts belonging to 3 Islamic educational institutions to avoid possible bias that these platforms are limited in their capacity to deliver the entirety of a philosophy. Even though technically, the account is managed by the individual (admin) of the school, the published content is a picture of the identity that the institution creates for the public. It is reinforced by the absence of discrepancies between published content and observed principles, as stated by the schools.

The data collection process was carried out from 2021 to 2022. Data collection is limited because the use of social media in learning Islamic education is more massive, especially after the COVID-19 pandemic (Zaini et al., 2021). The data analysis uses Online Analysis of social media that involves three fundamental processes: (a) Observing—watching the content to observe behaviors or speech that match component definitions, (b) Memoing—writing memos and journals to document video or photos content and our interpretation of it, and (c) Magnitude Coding—apply a first-cycle qualitative coding process using a magnitude coding approach (Snelson et al., 2021). MAXQDA 2020 (a qualitative analysis application) assists the data analysis process. Triangulation is used to maintain the validity of the data. This study uses source triangulation. We ensure that ethical procedures are strictly adhered to in conducting this research. We obtained ethical permission from the Ethics Committee at the Faculty of Tarbiyah and education, UIN Sunan Kalijaga, with decree number 05/FITK-RECC/VIII/2022, to conduct our research studies.

3. Finding

This study analyzes the contestation among religious schools representing religious affiliations in Indonesia. The ideological contestation between the three schools is manifested in the leading indicators observed on social media accounts. Eight main indicators are used to observe the social media accounts of SDNU Yogyakarta, SD Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta, and SDIT Taruna Al-Quran Yogyakarta. The eight indicators are curriculum, education model, uniform, terms (verbal symbols), scientific authority, religious discourse, textbooks, and stakeholders. These indicators are manifestations or extensions of Campbell's theory. He divides four layers of religious authority in the context of negotiations between religious beliefs and Internet use. The four layers are hierarchy, structures, ideology, and texts (Campbell, 2007). Curriculum and education model as part of the curriculum of religious education, uniform terms and stakeholders as parts of ideology and texts, while religious discourses, scientific authority and textbooks as parts of (religious) hierarchy and texts.

Most of the content posted by the three schools contains achievements. These achievements are in the form of academic and non-academic achievements. Content regarding this achievement shows that social media has become a marketing platform for the three schools to attract people to send their children to each of these schools. The first indicator used to observe is the form of the curriculum. All Schools use the national curriculum created by the government from the curriculum aspect. However, there is a distinguishing aspect between the three religious schools where SDNU Yogyakarta emphasizes NU's *Aswaja* values more. NU's *Aswaja* values are a Sunni understanding of moderate Islam in

Indonesian people's lives. This moderate Islam is more theological than political (Burhani, 2012). This ideological value is the basis for a tolerant, plural, and multicultural view (Fahmi & Rohman, 2021).

SD Muhammadiyah emphasizes *Kemuhammadiyah* values. *Kemuhammadiyah* is learning about the essence, vision and mission of the Muhammadiyah movement (Gunawan & Fanreza, 2020). The value of *Kemuhammadiyah* emphasizes the modernization of the Islamic religion. The ideology of modernization of the Islamic religion focuses SD Muhammadiyah's education on developing science and technology. From the view of this modernization ideology, SD Muhammadiyah, compared to SDNU and SDIT Taruna Al-Quran, has a higher academic achievement.

SDIT Taruna Al-Quran Yogyakarta emphasizes more on Salafi values. While at SDIT Taruna Al-Quran Yogyakarta, Salafi values emphasize the struggle to restore people's lives as in the time of the Prophet Muhammad. The desired ideals are fought for in the learning process with a curriculum attached to the image of Islam in the past. It can be seen from the extracurriculars that appear on social media where Curriculum archery, horse riding, and swimming are considered appropriate to the learning of the prophet era and are taught and made part of the school's extracurricular activities.

The second indicator used to observe social media is the educational model. SDNU Yogyakarta has a pesantren-based education model. As an educational subculture in Indonesia, Pesantren has a significant role in developing education in Indonesia. SD Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta uses the school education model. This model is a form of a more modern model. SDIT Taruna Al-Quran Yogyakarta emphasizes the boarding school-based education model. This boarding school model can also be explained as a modern form of pesantren, although it has different characteristics.

The third indicator is the uniform worn by the students. The three schools both use veils. The black sarong and cap are unique characteristics that are always related to the Islamic boarding school education model. From the appearance of the students that appeared on SDNU Yogyakarta's Facebook and Instagram accounts, students often use black sarongs and caps as a characteristic when studying. The sarong is a traditional Islamic symbol in the Indonesian context (Rustanta, 2019). SDIT Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta and SDIT Taruna Al-Quran Yogyakarta showed different appearances, wearing trousers. Even so, SDIT Taruna Al-Quran Yogyakarta uses a larger Veil. On the other hand, SDIT Taruna Al-Quran Yogyakarta posted

Picture 1. Photos of SDNU Yogyakarta activities



fewer views of its students, especially the faces of female students. It allegedly stems from the understanding that a woman's face is genitalia and should not be exposed on social media (Nonaka, 2021).

The fourth indicator is the term (verbal symbol) of each school. The contestation can be seen in terms of calling teachers. SDNU and SD Muhammadiyah use the term teacher like other non-religious schools. Meanwhile, SDIT Taruna Al-Quran Yogyakarta uses Ustadz and Ustadzah to call

Picture 2. Uniform of SDIT Taruna AL-Quran



teachers on social media. In addition, comments on social media content at SDIT Taruna AL-Quran use mostly Arabic terms compared to others. In terms of clothing, although they still wear white shirts and red trousers, the shirt designs are more like those commonly worn by the Salafi Muslim community (Damir-Geilsdorf et al., 2019); that is, the bottom is longer without a collar.

The fifth indicator is authority science. The unique characteristic of the three schools' social media content is the presence of distinctive religious quotes. In these quotes, there is a difference between schools in placing their religious authority. The content published by SDNU Yogyakarta is based on Kiai and the bahtsul masail forum. This forum is a forum for NU scholars to respond to

Picture 3. SD Muhammadiyah collaborates with Islamic schools in other countries (Malaysia)



their religious problems (Mufid, 2020). SD Muhammadiyah's content is based on the Tarjih majlis forum. This forum is also for Muhammadiyah scholars to determine policies dealing with religious problems (Ansori, 2022). The contents of SDIT Taruna Al-Quran are based on the fatwas of their ustadz, which are not centralized.

The sixth indicator is religious discourse. SDNU Yogyakarta's social media content shows many characteristics of traditional-moderate Islam. Traditional in question refers to Islamic values that have developed in Indonesia since ancient times. SD Muhammadiyah's social media content emphasizes the characteristics of moderate-modern Islam. The value of modernity is observed from the emphasis on science content. Besides that, this aspect of modernity can be seen in collaboration with Islamic schools in other countries.

Picture 4. One of SDIT Taruna Al-Qur'an's posts about Palestine



On the other hand, SD Taruna al-Quran social media content is more indicative of Islamic revivalist characteristics. This revivalist term can be interpreted as a desire to return Islam to the era of the Prophet Muhammad. In addition to returning to the Al-Quran and Al-Hadith, the spirit of international Islam can also be seen in posts about taking sides with international issues such as the Palestine issue.

This finding is reinforced by the seventh indicator, the textbook used as a reference source. SDNU emphasizes the use of the yellow book. The yellow book is a treasure trove of classical Islamic scholarship which continues to be cared for by the Nahdlatul Ulama organization through Islamic boarding schools. Different sources can be seen from SD Muhammadiyah, which is based on modern Islamic books. Besides that, SDIT Taruna Al-Quran emphasizes the Islamic Books of The Salafi Movement. The eighth indicator is stakeholders. SDNU Yogyakarta and SD Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta each have Stakeholders, namely citizens from the organization. Both have a more evident stakeholder base than SDIT Taruna Al-Quran stakeholders, who are more general public.

4. Discussion

This study aims to describe the ideological contestation carried out by the three Islamic schools in Indonesia. The observed ideological contestation is in social media posts from each school. The ideological contestation in question is reflected in the identities that appear on social media. These

identities are symbols of the religious and ideological background of the three Islamic schools. As has been widely studied, the philosophy of Islamic education places education in Islam as part and process of the embodiment of religion (al-Attas, 1991; Suwaed & Ali, 2016). Therefore, separating religion's position and role from education. It is not accessible Education burdened by religion will be confined by the role of mission or preaching rather than knowledge and skill abilities. At the same time, religion is always present (expressed) in its absence (in the *inexpressible*). However, its capacity to influence how education in religion is conceptualized is potentially rich in implications for how education in religion is conducted (McLaughlin, 1995). It is essential to develop students' reasoning on religion through confession. If Islamic education still overlaps in placing the position, role, and meaning of religion on the one hand and placing the position, role, and meaning of education, Islamic education will fail to compete in today's modern world. The tendency to be moderate still seems an option, as Hefner (2010) concluded that Muslim societies would strike a balance between open inquiry, religious community, and social control.

The study results show that the three Islamic educational institutions highlight a strong religious identity. Each of these different characteristics is certainly not in line with the expectations of unity in the national education system. Educational analysts indicate the existence of unity and integration in the national education system (H. H. Azra, 2018; Maksum, 1999). However, the same position and rights do not produce the same output. The study results show that every educational institution has used the national education curriculum, although it has not been fully integrated due to different ideological factors. Many factors make Islamic education still running in place, including curriculum issues. The curriculum load is the same as education in general (Tayeb, 2017). The heavy burden of the curriculum in Islamic education in Indonesia is one obstacle that makes Islamic education run slowly.

It must be admitted that there have been changes to the curriculum over time. Social and political factors mainly motivate the change process (Zuhdi, 2006). Indeed, there is a recommendation to make a more significant curriculum change (Araújo et al., 2015). However, curriculum changes almost occur because curriculum changes are always a tug of war between the interests of commitment and competence. The built curriculum is still in the category of a tug-of-war between individual commitment to religion, morals, and society with the interests of individual knowledge competencies. It can be seen in Table 1, where each educational institution builds a curriculum based on the ideological interests that are promoted. SDNU promotes moderate Traditionalist ideology, SD Muhammadiyah promotes Moderate Modern, while SDIT Taruna Al-Quran promotes Revivalist ideology. Here in line with the importance of a deep understanding of the position and existence of religion. In Indonesia, religion is everywhere, but religion is not everything. With a deep understanding of religion, one would be less and less tempted to place manufactured goods for people—an Islamic education curriculum. There are the importance of religious episteme on the one hand and curriculum on the other (Devis & William, 2003).

From the vision of Islamic education in Indonesia, the impression of modernity is displayed by SD Muhammadiyah. At the same time, traditional Islamic and Salafi educational institutions constantly confront the modernity of educational institutions (Hefner, 2008; Noorhaidi, 2008; Saada, 2018). Within the framework of Jawad Ridha, SD Muhammadiyah is close to the characteristics of the religious-rational flow (Ridla, 2002). The modernist characteristics of SD Muhammadiyah can be seen from the captions, which show the spirit of Islamic renewal. Although there are significant differences in Table 1, Florian Pohl shows his optimism that Islamic education in Indonesia has promoted the idea of non-violent Islamic moderation (Pohl, 2009). It means that perhaps the existence and role of Islamic education seem to have shifted from the development of science to a socio-political role.

It is widely believed that Islamic education for Muslims is part of a more extensive Islamic theology that rejects science, human autonomy, and secular realities (Hussain, 2010). This statement is undoubtedly incorrect, judging from the data where Islamic education also emphasizes

Table 1. The form of contestation from 3 religious-based schools in Indonesia

No.	Indicator	SDNU Yogyakarta	SD Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta	SDIT Taruna Al-Quran Yogyakarta
1	Curriculum	National + Aswaja NU	National + Kemuhammadiyah	National + Salafi
2	Educational Model	<i>Pesantren</i> , Madrasas, Schools	Schools, Madrasas	Boarding School
3	Uniform	<i>Sarung</i> , Veil	Trousers, Veil	Big Veil, Trousers
4	Term (verbal symbol)	<i>Kiai</i> , The Teacher,	Teacher, Ustadz	Ustadz, Ustadzah.
5	Authority science	<i>Kiai</i> , Bahtsul Masail	Majelis Tarjih	Ustadz
6	Discourse religious	Traditionalist moderate	Moderate Modern	Revivalist
7	textbook	<i>Kitab Kuning</i>	Islam Modern Books	Islamic Books of The Salafi Movement
8	Stakeholders	NU Citizens	Muhammadiyah Citizens	General public

the development of science, such as SD Muhammadiyah. However, when referring to the contestations in 3 Islamic educational institutions in general, scientific discourse is inferior to the struggle for socio-political meaning built by Islamic schools. Islamic education is based on religious texts and teachings. Humans are born with nature. People constantly struggle to find spiritual balance in their hearts to stay within or regain their *fitnah* in worldly life. Hussain writes that this struggle is the greater *jihād* where emotions such as love and hate, generosity and greed, compassion and aggression are found (Hussain, 2010). *Jihād* and *Ijtihād* provide potential energy for humans to build themselves and their society by dismantling previous mystical understandings. For Foucault, criticism means challenging and overturning the boundaries of existence, not judging them by transcendental standards (Hutchings, 1995). Thus, education must become the arena and tradition of criticism, as the spirit of criticism in Islam through *jihād* and *Ijtihād*.

Religion is a binding force (Ac-Kermann, 1985; Ahmad, 2017; Gardavský, 1970). Spirit criticism places religion as a response and human effort to get out of the mental shackles of a social system that does not respect human values. Islamic religious education becomes a space to build and apply criticism. Criticism means criticizing the rejection of injustice, ignorance, new imperialism, restrictions, and religious understanding by certain groups and interests. Islamic education has not implemented a technology development agenda. Islamic education has also not carried out a change agenda to anticipate the dehumanization of technology. Therefore, Islamic education as religious education must be the basis of criticism and place criticism as an ordinary socio-cultural practice (Ahmad, 2017).

Islamic education has not moved from its traditional characteristics and focuses on learning traditions oriented toward the past rather than the future (Ramadhani, 2021). It can be seen from the characteristics of SDNU Yogyakarta, which emphasizes maintaining tradition. What is needed is not looking for new options but something more urgent. Talal Asad (1986) concludes that Islam is a “discursive tradition” for discussion formations, which helps answer this question. Paulo Freire (2000) said that education should never become or produce prisons for students. Education must build dialogue and foster human-world relationships when education creates exclusive and closed individuals and mental and physical oppressions (Ware, 2014). The history of Islamic education is intertwined with sects (*madhab al-fiqh*) due to the textualist nature of Islamic education. As a result, Islamic education is divided into the Salafi jargon and claims closest to the truth following the *Qur’an and al-sunnah* (Noorhaidi, 2008). Finally, Islamic education is positioned as a guardian

of tradition (Kazmi, 2003). As a result, Islamic education produces exclusive students who claim to be the most correct.

This condition is undoubtedly a challenge for Islamic education. Islamic education must be open, dialogue, respect differences, and harmonization in the future. These qualities reflect the social perspective and the liberating character of knowledge. We must first change the educational paradigm to change the future of Islamic education. Islamic education must have a historical dimension while maintaining a normative dimension. The historical dimension of Islamic education is more anthropocentric than humanistic (theocentric). Liberating Islamic education means not choosing between the worldly and the hereafter dimensions. The historical paradigm of Islamic education requires it to be open to new knowledge in a constantly changing world (Sahin, 2018). A new reading tradition is needed based on dismantling historical, ideological, and textual frames to replace the old ones To open the epistemological core that has been closed in the construction of Islamic knowledge.

1 Conclusion

This study examined the contestation between religious schools representing religious affiliations in Indonesia. The contestation between educational institutions proves that there is still a distance between institutions with different ideologies in building meaning for Islamic education. Meanwhile, the three Islamic educational institutions compete to reveal the meaning of Islam according to the ideological affiliation of each Islamic school manifested in the educational concept, content, activity, and identity. This research has shown that specific religious values are contested in three schools. This contestation is evident in all school activities, rules, systems, and policies and in students' attitudes and behaviors through the contestation that event contradicts values. This research has limited itself to the performance contested in their social media or media center. It should be comprehensive research that employs objective indicators still necessary for Islamic identity education. A survey should be conducted to ascertain how curricula and contestation values influence students' identities using objective indicators.

Funding

The authors received no direct funding for this research.

Author details

Maemonah Maemonah¹
E-mail: maimunah@uin-suka.ac.id
ORCID ID: <http://orcid.org/0000-0003-2157-2043>
H. Zuhri²
Masturin Masturin³
Ahmad Syafii⁴
Hafidh Aziz^{4,5}

¹ Education for Islamic Elementary School Teachers Study Program, Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta, Indonesia.

² Aqidah and Islamic Philosophy study program, Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta, Indonesia.

³ Islamic Education study program, Tarbiyah Faculty, Institut Agama Islam Negeri Kudus, Indonesia.

⁴ Islamic Early Childhood Education study program, Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta, Indonesia.

⁵ Department of International Education, Faculty of Education and Human Development, The Education University of Hong Kong, Hong Kong.

Disclosure statement

No potential conflict of interest was reported by the author(s).

Citation information

Cite this article as: Contestation of Islamic educational institutions in Indonesia: Content analysis on social

media, Maemonah Maemonah, H. Zuhri, Masturin Masturin, Ahmad Syafii & Hafidh Aziz, *Cogent Education* (2023), 10: 2164019.

References

- Ac-Kermann, R. J. (1985). *Religion as critique*. University of Massachusetts Press.
- Ahmad, I. (2017). *Religion as critique: Islamic critical thinking from Mecca to marketplace*. The University of North Carolina Press.
- Ahmed, F. (2018). An exploration of naquib Al-Attas' theory of Islamic education as "Ta'Dib" as an 'Indigenous' educational philosophy. *Educational Philosophy and Theory*, 50(8), 786–794. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00131857.2016.1247685>
- al-Attas, N. (1991). *The concept of knowledge in Islam: A framework for an Islamic philosophy of education*. The International Institute of Islamic Thought and Civilisation.
- Aminnuddin, N. A. (2022). The religious struggle framework: Religious experience from struggle to transformation. *Islamic Guidance and Counseling Journal*, 5(1), 15–29. <https://doi.org/10.25217/igcj.v5i1.2099>
- Aminnuddin, N. A., & Hamid, H. S. A. (2021). Predictors of deviant behavior justification among Muslims: Sociodemographic factors, subjective well-being, and perceived religiousness. *Islamic Guidance and Counseling Journal*, 4(2), 144–157. <https://doi.org/10.25217/igcj.v4i2.1814>
- Ansori. (2022). Position of fatwa in Islamic law: The effectiveness of MUI, NU, and Muhammadiyah fatwas. *Ijtihad: Jurnal Wacana Hukum Islam Dan*

- Kemanusiaan*, 22(1), 53–71. <https://doi.org/10.18326/ijthad.v22i1.53-71>
- Araújo, J. L., Morais, C., & Paiva, J. C. (2015). Poetry and alkali metals: Building bridges to the study of atomic radius and ionization energy. *Chemistry Education Research and Practice*, 16(4), 893–900. Scopus. <https://doi.org/10.1039/c5rp00115c>
- Arifin, S. (2016). Islamic religious education and radicalism in Indonesia: Strategy of de-radicalization through strengthening the living values education. *Indonesian Journal of Islam and Muslim Societies*, 6(1), 93. <https://doi.org/10.18326/ijims.v6i1.93-126>
- Arimbi, D. A. (2009). Representation, identity and religion: Images of Muslim women, their lives and struggles in fiction (Part I). In Diah Ariani Arimbi (Ed.), *Reading contemporary Indonesian Muslim women writers* (pp. 107–142). Amsterdam University Press JSTOR. <https://doi.org/10.2307/j.ctt46n07t.9>
- Asad, T. (1986). *The Idea of an Anthropology of Islam*. Georgetown University Center for Contemporary Arab Studies.
- Azmi, M. N. L., Isyaku, H., Ali, E. M. T. B. E., Hidayah, A. T., Bin Yah Alias, M. H., Bin Anas, M., & Suhaimi, N. I. (2020). Teachers' perceptions of Islamic self-identity formation through language learning among students in selected religious secondary schools. *International Journal of Society, Culture and Language*, 8(1), 82–91. https://www.ijsc.net/article_38469.html
- Azra, A. (2017). Islamic education and reintegration of sciences: Improving Islamic higher education. *Media Syari'ah: Wahana Kajian Hukum Islam Dan Pranata Sosial*, 15(2), Article 2. <https://doi.org/10.22373/jms.v15i2.1779>
- Azra, H. (2018). Islamic Education in Indonesia. In H. Daun & R. Arjmand (Eds.), *Handbook of Islamic Education* (pp. 763–780). Springer.
- Bashori, B., Prasetyo, M. A. M., & Susanto, E. (2020). Change management transformation in Islamic education of Indonesia. *Social Work and Education*, 7(1), 84–99. <https://doi.org/10.25128/2520-6230.20.1.7>
- Belonozhko, M. L., Barbakov, O., Khairullina, M., Siteva, S. S., & Fomichev, I. Y. (2017). Islamic factor influence on religious identity. *Journal of Political and Military Sociology*, 45(1), 36–48. 00472697. <https://www.scopus.com/inward/record.uri?eid=2-s2.0-85043242437&partnerID=40&md5=006159f197e8ed724312464d33dcec70>
- Bengtsson, M. (2016). How to plan and perform a qualitative study using content analysis. *NursingPlus Open*, 2, 8–14. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.npls.2016.01.001>
- Burhani, A. N. (2012). Al-Tawassut wa-l I'tidāl: The NU and moderatism in Indonesian Islam. *Asian Journal of Social Science*, 40(5–6), 564–581. <https://doi.org/10.1163/15685314-12341262>
- Campbell, H. (2007). Who's got the power? Religious authority and the internet. *Journal of Computer-Mediated Communication*, 12(3), 1043–1062. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1083-6101.2007.00362.x>
- Chakim, S. (2022). The Youth and the Internet: The construction of doctrine, Islam in practice, and political identity in Indonesia. *Journal of Social Studies Education Research*, 13(1), 217–236. 1309-9108. <https://jsser.org/index.php/jsser/article/view/3727>
- Cohen, L., Manion, L., & Morrison, K. (2017). Research Methods in Education. *Research Methods in Education*. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315456539>
- Cook, B. (1999). Islamic versus western conceptions of education: Reflections on Egypt. *International Review of Education*, 45 15730638. <https://doi.org/10.1023/A:1003808525407>
- Damir-Geilsdorf, S., Menzfeld, M., & Hedider, Y. (2019). Interpretations of al-wala' wa-l-bara' in Everyday Lives of Salafis in Germany. *Religions*, 10(2), 124. Article 2. <https://doi.org/10.3390/rel10020124>
- Das, S. W. H., Holik, A., Zulfianah, Z., & Naim, M. (2018). Strategies of Islamic Education Teachers to Increase Students' Interest In Learning and Practicing in State Junior High School Lanrisang (SMPN) 1 Lanrisang, Pinrang. *Madania: Jurnal Kajian Keislaman*, 22(2), Article 2. <https://doi.org/10.29300/madania.v22i2.1272>
- Devis, A., & William, K. (2003). Epistemology and Curriculum. In P. Banlinger, Nigel. B., Paul. S., Richard, S., & Paul. S. (Eds.), *The Blackwell Guide to the Philosophy of Education* (pp. 221–238). 9780470996294. Blackwell Publishing Ltd. <https://doi.org/10.1002/97804709962941ch15>
- Dolunay A, Kasap F and Keçeci G. (2017). Freedom of Mass Communication in the Digital Age in the Case of the Internet: "Freedom House" and the USA Example. *Sustainability*, 9(10), 1739. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su9101739>
- Dressler, M., Salvatore, A., & Wohlrab-Sahr, M. (2019). Islamicate Secularities: New Perspectives on a Contested Concept. *Historical social research/historische sozialforschung*, 44(3), 7–34. 01726404. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/26747447>
- Fahmi, I. R., & Rohman, M. A. A. (2021). Non-dikotomi ilmu: integrasi-interkoneksi dalam Pendidikan Islam. Article 2. *AL-MIKRAJ: Jurnal Studi Islam Dan Humaniora (E- 2745-4584)*. 1(2). <https://doi.org/10.37680/almikraj.v1i2.750>
- Fazlurrahman, M. (2018). Modernisasi Pendidikan Islam: Gagasan Alternatif Fazlur Rahman. Article 1. *TA'LIM: Jurnal Studi Pendidikan Islam*, 1(1). <https://doi.org/10.52166/talim.v1i1.634>
- Freire, P. (2000). *Pedagogy of the Oppressed*. Continuum.
- Gardavský, V. (1970). *Hoffnung aus der Skepsis*. Keisar Verlag.
- Graaf, N. D. D. (2013). Secularization: Theoretical controversies generating empirical research. In Rafael. W., Tom A.B. Snijders & Victor. N. (Eds.), *The Handbook of Rational Choice Social Research* (pp. 322–354). Stanford University Press. <https://doi.org/10.1515/9780804785501-012>
- Gunawan, & Fanreza, R. (2020). *The implementation of character values through Al-Islam and Kemuhmadiyah at sekolah menengah pertama muhammadiyah 01 medan*. International Conference on Community Development, 2020. 272–274. <https://doi.org/10.2991/assehr.k.201017.059>
- Halstead, M. (2004). An Islamic concept of education. *Comparative Education*, 40(4), 517–529. <https://doi.org/10.1080/0305006042000284510>
- Hefner, R. W. (Ed.). (2008). *Making modern Muslims: The politics of Islamic education in Southeast Asia* (Illustrated ed.). University of Hawaii Press.
- Hefner, R. W. (Ed.). (2010). *The New Cambridge history of Islam: Volume 6: Muslims and Modernity: Culture and Society since 1800* (Vol. 6). Cambridge University Press. <https://doi.org/10.1017/COL9780521844437>
- Hidayatullah, R. (2021). Music, contentious politics, and Identity: A cultural analysis of "Aksi Bela Islam" March in Jakarta (2016). *Studia Islamika*, 28(1), 53–96. <https://doi.org/10.36712/sdi.v28i1.11140>
- Hussain, A. (2010). Islamic Education in the West: Theoretical Foundations and Practical Implications. In K. Engebretson (Ed.), *International Handbook of Inter-religious Education* (pp. 235–248). 978-1-4020-

- 9260-2. Springer. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-1-4020-9260-2_15
- Hutchings, K. (1995). *Kant, Critique and Politics*. Routledge.
- Ikhwan, A., Farid, M., Rohmad, A., & Syam, A. (2020). *Revitalization of Islamic Education Teachers in the Development of Student Personality*. In the proceedings of 1st Borobudur International Symposium on Humanities, Economics and Social Sciences, 2020 (Vol. 1, pp. 162–165). Atlantis Press. <https://doi.org/10.2991/assehr.k.200529.034>
- Kazmi, Y. (2003). Islamic Education: Traditional Education or Education of Tradition? *Islamic Studies*, 42(2), 259–288. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/20837271>
- Krippendorff, K. (2022). Content Analysis: An Introduction to Its Methodology. *Content Analysis: An Introduction to Its Methodology*, 31(6), 3460–3468. <https://doi.org/10.4135/9781071878781>
- Kuntowijoyo. (2018). *Muslim tanpa Masjid*. 978-979-9471-43-7. Yogyakarta: Mata Bangsa.
- Lukens-Bull, R. A. (2001). Two Sides of the Same Coin: Modernity and Tradition in Islamic Education in Indonesia. *Anthropology Education Quarterly*, 32(3), 350–372. <https://doi.org/10.1525/aeq.2001.32.3.350>
- Lukens-Bull, R. (2019). Pesantren, Madrasa and the Future of Islamic Education in Indonesia. *Kawalu: Journal of Local Culture*, 6(1), 29. <https://doi.org/10.32678/kawalu.v6i1.2044>
- Machali, I., Safitri, E., & Wulandari, F. (2021). Shifting Variants and Ideological Affiliations of Islamic Education Institutions in the Special Region of Yogyakarta. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 10(1), Article 1. <https://doi.org/10.14421/jpi.2021.101.107-132>
- Maemonah. (2015). *Filsafat Pendidikan Agama: Telaah Pemikiran Naquib al-Attas dan N. Driyarkara*. FA Press.
- Maemonah, M., Purnama, S., Rohinah, R., Hafidh 'Aziz, B., & Syafii, A. (2022). The Shift in the Authority of Islamic Religious Education: A Qualitative Content Analysis on Online Religious Teaching. *The Qualitative Report*, 27(9), 1830–1846. <https://doi.org/10.46743/2160-3715/2022.5325>
- Maksum. (1999). *Sejarah Madrasah dan Perkembangannya*. Jakarta: Logos Wacana Ilmu.
- Malik, B. A. (2014). *Producing Islam: An Ethnography of Muslim Beliefs, Islamist Politics and Academic Secularity at A Pakistani Sufi Madrasa* [Dissertation]. Harvard University.
- Masuda, K., & Yudhistira, M. H. (2020). Does education secularize the Islamic population? The effect of years of schooling on religiosity, voting, and pluralism in Indonesia. *World Development*, 130, 1–31. 0305-750X. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.worlddev.2020.104915>
- McLaughlin, T. H. (1995). Wittgenstein, Education and Religion. In P. Smeyers & J. D. Marshall (Eds.), *Philosophy and Education: Accepting Wittgenstein's Challenge* (pp. 171–187). Springer Netherlands. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-94-017-2616-0_11
- Mufid, M. (2020). Green Fatwas in Bahtsul Masail: Nahdlatul Ulama's Response to the Discourse of Environmental Crisis in Indonesia. *Al-Ihkam: Jurnal Hukum Dan Pranata Sosial*, 15(2), 173–200. <https://doi.org/10.19105/al-ihkam.v15i2.3956>
- Mulkhan, A. M. (2008). Islamic Education and Da'wah Liberalization: Investigating Kiai Achmad Dachlan's Ideas. *Al-Jami'ah: Journal of Islamic Studies*, 46(2), 401. <https://doi.org/10.14421/ajis.2008.462.401-430>
- Nonaka, Y. (2021). Practising Sunnah for reward of heaven in the afterlife: The expansion of cadar wearing among urban Muslim women in Indonesia. *Indonesia and the Malay World*, 49(145), 429–447. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13639811.2021.1952018>
- Noorhaidi. (2008). The Madrasah Salafi in Indonesia. In F. M. Noor (Ed.), *The Madrasa in Asia: Political Activism and Transnational Linkages* (pp. 247–274). Amsterdam University Press. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/j.ctt46n10w.13>
- özdalga, E. (2018). Islamic Education in Turkey. In H. Daun & R. Arjmand (Eds.), *Handbook of Islamic Education* (pp. 593–609). Springer. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-64683-1_44
- Patmanthara, S., Febiharsa, D., & Dwiyanto, F. A. (2019). Social Media as a Learning Media: A Comparative Analysis of YouTube, WhatsApp, Facebook and Instagram Utilization. *ICEEIE 2019 - International Conference on Electrical, Electronics and Information Engineering: Emerging Innovative Technology for Sustainable Future*, 183–186. <https://doi.org/10.1109/ICEEIE47180.2019.8981441>
- Pohl, F. (2009). *Islamic Education and the Public Sphere: Today's Pesantren in Indonesia*. 3830919298. Waxmann.
- Rahman, T., Nurnisya, F. Y., Nurjanah, A., & Hifziati, L. (2021). Hijrah and the articulation of Islamic identity of Indonesian millennials on Instagram. *Jurnal Komunikasi: Malaysian Journal of Communication*, 37(2), 154–170. <https://doi.org/10.17576/JKMJC-2021-3702-10>
- Ramadhani, Y. (2021). Pengetahuan dan Kekuasaan Menurut Michel Foucault dan Analisis Wacana Pendidikan. *Tarbawi*, 10(2), Article 02. <http://www.journal.stitdaruhihijrahmp.ac.id/index.php/Jurnal/article/view/21>
- Ridla, M. J. (2002). *Tiga Aliran Utama Teori Pendidikan Islam: Perspektif Sosiologis-Filosofis*. 979-9340-42-X. Yogyakarta: Tiara Wacana.
- Rustanta, A. (2019). Makna Simbolik Busana Sarung Kyai Ma'ruf Amin. *KOMUNIKATIF: Jurnal Ilmiah Komunikasi*, 8(2), Article 2. <https://doi.org/10.33508/jk.v8i2.2197>
- Saada, N. (2018). The Theology of Islamic Education from Salafi and Liberal Perspectives. *Religious Education*, 113(4), 406–418. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00344087.2018.1450607>
- Sahin, A. (2018). Critical Issues in Islamic Education Studies: Rethinking Islamic and Western Liberal Secular Values of Education. *Religions*, 9(11), 335. Article 11. <https://doi.org/10.3390/rel9110335>
- Sakai, M., & Isbah, M. F. (2014). Limits to Religious Diversity Practice in Indonesia: Case Studies from Religious Philanthropic Institutions and Traditional Islamic Schools. *Asian Journal of Social Science*, 42(6), 722–746. <https://doi.org/10.1163/15685314-04206003>
- Schreier, M. (2012). *Qualitative Content Analysis in Practice*. In *Qualitative Content Analysis in Practice*. SAGE.
- Snelson, C., Yang, D., & Temple, T. (2021). Addressing the Challenges of Online Video Analysis in Qualitative Studies: A Worked Example from Computational Thinking Research. *The Qualitative Report*, 26(6), 1974–1988. <https://doi.org/10.46743/2160-3715/2021.4734>
- Suwaed, M., & Ali, N. (2016). Education, identity, and ideology: The Islamic movement and Moslem religious education in Israel. *Social Identities*, 22(4), 426–449. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13504630.2015.1128811>
- Syafii, A., & Retnowati, H. (2022). *Opportunities and Challenges of Online Learning Methods in Religious Education*. Proceedings of the 5th International Conference on Current Issues in Education (pp. 285–

- 290). Atlantis Press. <https://doi.org/10.2991/assehr.k.220129.052>
- Tan, C. (2011). *Islamic Education and Indoctrination: The Case in Indonesia*. Routledge.
- Tan, C. (2018). Colonialism, Post colonialism, Islam and Education. In H. Daun & R. Arjmand (Eds.), *Handbook of Islamic Education* (pp. 1–12). 978-3-319-53620-0. Springer. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-53620-0_22-1
- Tayeb, A. (2017). State Islamic orthodoxies and Islamic education in Malaysia and Indonesia. *Kajian Malaysia*, 35(2), 1–20. <https://doi.org/10.21315/km2017.35.2.1>
- Thomas, R. M. (1988). The Islamic Revival and Indonesian Education. *Asian Survey*, 28(9), 897–915. <https://doi.org/10.2307/2644797>
- Thomas, R. M. (1997). *Moral Development Theories: Secular and Religious*. Greenwood Press.
- Tsourlaki, S. (2020). Khaled Abou El Fadl and Amina Wadud's (re)politicisation of the mosque and employment of social media as a means of shaping religious identity based on values of progressive Islam. *Contemporary Islam*, 14(3), 309–329. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11562-020-00453-z>
- Ware, R. T. (2014). *The walking Qur'an: Islamic education, embodied knowledge, and history in West Africa* (Illustrated ed.). The University of North Carolina Press.
- Zaini, H., Afriantoni, H., Sofyan, A., Faisal, P., Hamzah, A., rin, P., & Hamzah, A. (2021). Covid-19 and Islamic Education in School: Searching for alternative learning media. *Webology*, 18(1), 154–165. <https://doi.org/10.14704/WEB/V18I1/WEB18080>
- Ztf, P. B. (2011). Prophetic social sciences: Toward an Islamic-based transformative social sciences. *Indonesian Journal of Islam and Muslim Societies*, 1(1), 95. Article 1. <https://doi.org/10.18326/ijims.v1i1.95-121>
- Zuhdi, M. (2006). Modernization of Indonesian Islamic Schools' Curricula, 1945 to 2003. *International Journal of Inclusive Education*, 10(4), 415–427. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13603110500430765>



© 2023 The Author(s). This open access article is distributed under a Creative Commons Attribution (CC-BY) 4.0 license.

You are free to:

Share — copy and redistribute the material in any medium or format.
Adapt — remix, transform, and build upon the material for any purpose, even commercially.
The licensor cannot revoke these freedoms as long as you follow the license terms.

Under the following terms:

Attribution — You must give appropriate credit, provide a link to the license, and indicate if changes were made.
You may do so in any reasonable manner, but not in any way that suggests the licensor endorses you or your use.
No additional restrictions

You may not apply legal terms or technological measures that legally restrict others from doing anything the license permits.



Cogent Education (ISSN: 2331-186X) is published by Cogent OA, part of Taylor & Francis Group.

Publishing with Cogent OA ensures:

- Immediate, universal access to your article on publication
- High visibility and discoverability via the Cogent OA website as well as Taylor & Francis Online
- Download and citation statistics for your article
- Rapid online publication
- Input from, and dialog with, expert editors and editorial boards
- Retention of full copyright of your article
- Guaranteed legacy preservation of your article
- Discounts and waivers for authors in developing regions

Submit your manuscript to a Cogent OA journal at www.CogentOA.com



Contestation of Islamic educational institutions in Indonesia: Content analysis on social media

ORIGINALITY REPORT

13%

SIMILARITY INDEX

12%

INTERNET SOURCES

8%

PUBLICATIONS

%

STUDENT PAPERS

PRIMARY SOURCES

1	doaj.org Internet Source	3%
2	nsuworks.nova.edu Internet Source	3%
3	www.researchgate.net Internet Source	2%
4	helda.helsinki.fi Internet Source	2%
5	ejournal.uin-suka.ac.id Internet Source	2%
6	"Handbook of Islamic Education", Springer Science and Business Media LLC, 2018 Publication	2%

Exclude quotes On

Exclude bibliography On

Exclude matches < 2%